Case 1:13-cv-02992-AT Document 80 Filed 12/22/14 Page 1 of 111

EC95sal1 1 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK 2 3 ENRIQUE SALINAS , ALFREDO RODRIGUEZ, ANGEL CEDENO, CHRISTIAN URGILES, FRANCISCO 4 LUGO, JOSE AMEZQUITA, LUIS 5 ROBALLO, MIGUEL CERVANTES, NAHUN FLORES, PABLO ALVARADO, PABLO FRANCISCO-LOPEZ, 6 VALENTIN XOCHIPILTECATL AND 7 VICENTE LEON, individually and on behalf of others similarly situated, 8 9 Plaintiffs, 13 Civ. 2992 (AT) 10 v. 11 STARJEM RESTAURANT CORP (d/b/a FRESCO BY SCOTTO) MARION SCOTTO and ANTHONY SCOTTO, 12 13 Defendants. 14 New York, N.Y. December 9, 2014 15 9:20 a.m. 16 Before: 17 HON. ANALISA TORRES, 18 District Judge 19 **APPEARANCES** 20 MICHAEL FAILLACE & ASSOCIATES, P.C. 21 Attorneys for Plaintiffs BY: JOSHUA ANDROPHY 22 SHAWN CLARK 23 LITTLER MENDELSON, P.C. Attorneys for Defendants 24 BY: CRAIG BENSON NAVEEN KABIR 25 ALSO PRESENT: EUGENE ALVARES, Spanish interpreter

EC95sal1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

1 (Trial resumed)

2 | THE COURT: Good morning.

Good morning, Mr. Salinas. You are very late.

THE WITNESS: (In English) I apologize.

THE WITNESS: I apologize. I very much apologize.

THE COURT: You must make sure that you get here on time because this is too much of a delay.

You may continue with cross-examination.

MR. BENSON: Thank you, your Honor.

ENRIQUE SALINAS, resumed.

- 11 CROSS EXAMINATION
- 12 BY MR. BENSON:
- 13 Q. Good morning, Mr. Salinas.
- 14 A. Good morning.
- 15 \parallel Q. Mr. Salinas, I put back a copy of your deposition and I
- 16 direct your attention to page 46 of that deposition,
- 17 | specifically line 6. Were you asked the following questions
- 18 and did you give the following answers:
- 19 "Q Mr. Salinas, do you know what I mean when I am referring to
- 20 | side work?
- 21 | "A Yes. That is correct.
- 22 | "Q So, what was your side work as a busboy? Let's limit it to
- 23 | side work prior to the shift beginning, if any.
- 24 | "A Okay. Normally are you talking about the side work, are
- 25 | you not? Normal?

- 1 "Q At the beginning of the shift.
- 2 "A Folding napkins, put glasses at the station. That's normal."
- And then I direct your attention to the next page, 47, specifically line 4:
- "Q All right. That's what I'm asking about. How long does that take, the side work at the beginning of the shift?
- 8 | "A Half an hour."
 - Were you asked those questions and did you give those answers?
- 11 A. Correct.

9

- 12 | Q. Is that testimony truthful and accurate?
- 13 A. Correct.
- Q. Now, folding napkins is something that assists in the
- 15 | service, correct?
- 16 A. Correct.
- Q. And putting glasses at the station, that also assists in
- 18 the service, correct?
- 19 A. Correct.
- 20 | Q. They both directly affect the busser's ability to service
- 21 | the customers, correct?
- 22 A. Correct.
- 23 | Q. Now, I direct your attention to the same page, 47,
- 24 | specifically line 10:
- 25 | "Q Okay. And was there side work at the end of the shift as a

1 | busser?

- 2 | "A To clean the stations. I forgot to tell you that we had
- 3 | ice buckets at stations in order to put ice. At the end of the
- 4 | night we had to dump the ice and clean the stations clean, keep
- 5 stations clean.
- 6 | "Q So, that side work you are saying at the end of the shift,
- 7 | right?
- 8 | "A Yes.
- 9 | "Q How long did that take?
- 10 | "A Let's say between 20 and 30 minutes."
- 11 Were you asked those questions and did you give those
- 12 | answers?
- 13 A. Correct.
- 14 | Q. And is that testimony truthful and accurate?
- 15 A. Correct.
- 16 Q. Now, keeping a station clean out on the service floor is a
- 17 | essential function of a busser's job, correct?
- 18 A. Correct.
- 19 | THE COURT: Mr. Benson?
- 20 MR. BENSON: Yes.
- 21 | THE COURT: If you would make sure that you bring the
- 22 | mic closer to you so that you can be heard better from here?
- 23 MR. BENSON: Okay, your Honor. I apologize. I
- 24 usually never have a problem with my voice carrying. In fact,
- I have been, on several occasions, told to tone it down. So, I

- 1 | will oblige.
- 2 BY MR. BENSON:
- 3 Q. Now, Mr. Salinas, you know who Anthony Scotto, Jr. is,
- 4 | correct?
- 5 | A. Correct.
- 6 Q. He is the head of the restaurant, is he not?
- 7 A. Correct.
- 8 Q. You see him there every day, correct?
- 9 A. Correct.
- 10 | Q. He is there all the time, is he not?
- 11 A. That is so.
- 12 | Q. You have heard him yelling and screaming around the
- 13 | restaurant?
- 14 A. Correct.
- 15 | Q. Telling people what to do?
- 16 A. Correct.
- 17 | Q. And he does that all the time, doesn't he?
- 18 | A. That is so.
- 19 | Q. He is very involved in all of the decisions in the
- 20 | restaurant, correct?
- 21 | A. I do not know about all the decisions but largely so,
- 22 correct.
- 23 | Q. So you don't have -- based on your observation, though, he
- 24 | is involved in all major decisions in the restaurant, is he
- 25 | not?

- 1 A. Correct.
- 2 Q. And do you know his role in hiring and firing at the
- 3 | restaurant?
- 4 A. I do not know.
- 5 Q. Do you know his role in setting wages at the restaurant?
- 6 A. No. No, I do not know that.
- 7 Q. And do you know who keeps employment records at the
- 8 restaurant and whether Mr. Scotto has any role in that?
- 9 A. I was provided with a paper in 2013, not before 2006. Six 10 years afterwards I was provided with a paper on how much I was
- 11 \parallel paid by the hour, never before.
- 12 | THE COURT: Sustained. The answer is unresponsive.
- 13 Mr. Salinas, I want you to listen carefully to the
- 14 question and answer the question that he has asked without
- 15 giving additional information.
- 16 THE WITNESS: Correct.
- 17 THE COURT: You may read back the question.
- 18 (Record read)
- 19 THE WITNESS: I do not know, sir.
- 20 BY MR. BENSON:

- 21 Q. Now, most people who come to work at Fresco Restaurant have
- 22 | to work for several days training before they are officially
- 23 | hired; is that correct?
- 24 | A. I do not know that.
 - Q. And during that time they are observed by Mr. Scotto to

determine whether they are suitable to work at the restaurant, correct?

- MR. ANDROPHY: Objection. The witness says he doesn't
- 4 know if people train so now he is being asked what happens
- 5 during this training period but he said he doesn't know if
- 6 there is training.
- 7 THE COURT: Mr. Benson?
- 8 MR. BENSON: I will withdraw the question, your Honor.
- 9 BY MR. BENSON:
- 10 | Q. Do you know who Marion Scotto is?
- 11 | A. Yes.
- 12 | Q. She is also a member of the Scotto family, correct?
- 13 A. Correct.
- 14 | Q. And she sits at the front of the restaurant and greets
- 15 | customers, correct?
- 16 A. Correct.
- 17 | Q. Do you know what role, if any, that Marion Scotto plays in
- 18 | employment decisions at Fresco?
- 19 A. I do not know that.
- 20 Q. Do you know if she has any role in setting wages?
- 21 A. No. I do not know.
- 22 | Q. Do you know if she has any role in keeping employment
- 23 | records?
- 24 A. No. No, I do not know that.
- 25 | Q. Do you know if she plays any role in scheduling?

- A. I do not know. What I do know is that the manager did that.
 - MR. BENSON: Move to strike, your Honor; again, not responsive. I am asking what Marion Scotto --
 - THE COURT: Sustained.
- 6 Listen to the question and answer the question,
 7 Mr. Salinas.
- THE WITNESS: Okay. I do not know so. I do not know so.
- 10 BY MR. BENSON:

3

4

- Q. Do you know what role, if any, Marion Scotto plays in any employment decision in the restaurant?
- 13 A. I do not know that. I believe that she would hire the hostesses. That's what I think, believe.
- 15 | Q. But you don't know that, do you?
- 16 A. Not exactly.
- 17 | Q. Not exactly meaning you don't know?
- 18 A. I do not know it. I do not know it.
- 19 Q. Thank you. Now, let's talk about your hiring at the 20 restaurant.
- You claim that you just walked into the restaurant, correct?
- 23 A. Correct.
- 24 | Q. Did you have a resume with you?
- 25 A. Correct.

- 1 | Q. So you did have a resume?
- 2 A. Yes, correct.
- 3 | Q. And you were told to come back the next day, correct?
- 4 \blacksquare A. That is so.
- Q. And you were supposed to come back to train, correct?
- 6 INTERPRETER: I didn't --
- 7 Q. I said you were supposed to come back to train, correct?
- 8 A. Correct.
- 9 Q. Now, it is your testimony that you didn't speak to
- 10 Mr. Scotto during that time when you dropped your resume off?
- 11 | INTERPRETER: Did or did not?
- 12 | Q. During the time when you dropped your resume off.
- 13 INTERPRETER: Did or did not speak to Mr. Scotto.
- 14 | Q. Is it your testimony that you did not speak to Mr. Scotto?
- 15 A. Correct.
- 16 | Q. And you did come back to the restaurant the next day,
- 17 | correct?
- 18 A. Correct.
- 19 Q. Do you know whether Mr. Scotto was there or not the day you
- 20 | came back?
- 21 A. I did not see him that day.
- 22 | Q. Do you know if he was there or not?
- 23 \parallel A. I did not see him that day. He was not there --
- 24 | Q. What time of year was -- sorry.
- 25 What time of year was that?

- If I remember correctly it was November, December. Must 1 2 have been.
- 3 Q. And that is the busiest time of the year for the 4 restaurant, is it not?
- 5 Correct. Α.

7

8

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

- And you have since come to know that Mr. Scotto is at the restaurant every day, have you not?
- Some days he was not there.
- 9 Is it your testimony that Mr. Scotto wasn't there during 10 the busiest days of the year?
 - A. He was always there but there were some days that he was not.
 - Q. And is it your testimony that he wasn't there on the days that you were called back to train?
 - A. The first day that I had to be trained I did not see him. In my testimony on my first day of training I never trained because the subway, they had a strike at the subway. wait for a person so that he/she would give me training and they told me that there were five busboys but there was only one and the manager Brent told me: Today you don't train, from today you will start working.
 - That's what happened. That's the way, but that day I did not see Mr. Scotto.
- 24 MR. BENSON: Other than the not seeing Mr. Scotto I 25 would move to strike as non-responsive. I simply asked him

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

13

14

19

when he saw Mr. Scotto there.

MR. ANDROPHY: Mr. Benson was asking him guestions about when he came to train and so I think it is proper for the witness to clarify the record to explain that he didn't actually train.

THE COURT: Overruled.

BY MR. BENSON:

Q. Okay, Mr. Salinas.

So you can't testify for certain that he was not at the restaurant that day, can you?

- 11 THE COURT: Asked and answered, counsel. You asked 12 this question repeatedly.
 - Q. Now, Mr. Salinas, isn't it true that you don't know who made the decision to hire you?
- A. No. I do not know so. 15
- Mr. Salinas, do you know who Brent Drill is? 16
- 17 INTERPRETER: Brent Rill?
- Brent Drill. D-R-I-L-L. 18 Ο.
 - For me he was a manager. Α.
- 20 His title was floor captain, was it not? Floor captain?
- 21 A. For me he always was the manager. I do not know. Nobody
- 22 explained to me whether he was a captain but for me he was a
- 23 manager.
- 24 I don't want to extend this but I will give you an 25 example. He was the one who would discipline us and he would

EC95sal1

Salinas - cross

- 1 make decisions as to who would be working at the stations. Не 2 was the manager.
- 3 MR. BENSON: Your Honor, I asked what his title was.
- 4 THE COURT: So this is going to come out on the redirect but I will, if you want, if you are asking me to 5
- strike it, I will strike it. 6
- 7 MR. BENSON: All right. That's fine. Fair enough.
- 8 BY MR. BENSON:
- 9 Q. Now Mr. Drill, when he worked, was on the service floor the 10 entire time, correct?
- 11 Α. Correct.
- 12 And he stayed mostly in the VIP section, correct?
- 13 Correct. Correct. Α.
- That is station 1, correct? 14 Q.
- 15 Α. 1 and 2 it is.
- Mr. Drill was also very knowledgeable in wine, correct? 16
- 17 Correct. Α.
- 18 And he would go around the whole restaurant to explain and
- 19 serve the wine, correct?
- Correct, but not only he, Attilio too, the other manager. 20
- 21 Attilio also explained the wine to the customers and poured
- 22 the wine for the customers, correct?
- 23 The same way as the waiters, correct.
- 24 Now, Mr. Drill, as part of his responsibilities, would take
- 25 the drink orders in the VIP section as well, correct?

- 1 A. Correct.
- 2 Q. And he put in orders for special requests.
- 3 A. Correct.
- 4 | Q. Like if a guest wanted something that wasn't on the menu?
- 5 A. That is so. Correct.
- 6 Q. So he would take care of those food orders directly,
- 7 | correct?
- 8 A. Correct.
- 9 Q. And he did that every shift that he was on duty, didn't he?
- 10 A. Correct.
- 11 Q. So, in the stations where he worked it was like there were
- 12 | two waiters, correct?
- 13 A. Correct.
- 14 | Q. Now, you know who Attilio Vosilla is?
- 15 A. The manager, because he would arrange our schedules, he
- 16 would make our schedules. And, he also took decisions which
- 17 | waiters would work at the private parties or who would work at
- 18 | the VIP section or at the regular stations; he would, at the
- 19 | major dining room.
- 20 MR. BENSON: Same objection.
- 21 THE COURT: Are you asking me to strike it?
- 22 MR. BENSON: No. I will try to save us all time.
- 23 BY MR. BENSON:
- 24 Q. Mr. Vosilla was also on the service floor the whole time,
- 25 | correct?

- 1 A. Correct.
- 2 Q. And he did the same things as Mr. Drill did that you just
- 3 testified to, correct?
- 4 A. Correct.
- 5 | Q. And he also worked as a party captain, correct?
- 6 A. Correct.
- 7 Q. And you also worked those sometimes, parties; did you not?
- 8 A. That is so. I said that yesterday.
- 9 Q. So, you have seen Mr. Vosilla during those parties greet
- 10 | the host and interact with the host of the parties, correct?
- 11 A. Correct.
- 12 | Q. Check in with them throughout the meal?
- 13 A. Correct.
- 14 | Q. Answer questions about the menu or the wine list?
- 15 \parallel A. Yes. That is so.
- 16 Q. Take the food and drink orders to the guests at the party?
- 17 A. Well, during the parties the waiters would take the orders
- 18 | for the beverages and the food, yes. Yes, he did serve it.
- 19 Q. You would see Mr. Vosilla open wine and serve wine for the
- 20 parties?
- 21 | A. Normally he would say which wines were going to be sold and
- 22 | he would take them over to the party area and he would tell the
- 23 | waiters what type of wine they had ordered. But, the ones who
- 24 poured the wine at the private parties, were the waiters.
- 25 | Q. Is it your testimony that you never saw Mr. Vosilla pouring

- 1 | wine at the parties?
- 2 A. A few times I did see him.
- 3 Q. Now, Mr. Vosilla also, in the presence of the customers,
- 4 | plates the pasta course, does he not?
- 5 A. Yes. Correct.
- 6 Q. And he coordinates all the dishes that are served, correct?
- 7 A. Correct.
- 8 Q. Do you know who Marco is?
- 9 | A. Yes.
- 10 | Q. He also works as a party captain, correct?
- 11 A. Sometimes, yes.
- 12 Q. And as a party captain -- not as a party captain -- did I
- 13 | say party captain or floor captain?
- Did he also act as a floor captain?
- 15 | A. I want to clear something here. I don't want to extend
- 16 | myself too much. When he was placed as a captain they did
- 17 | explain to us, yes, he is the captain. They would tell us that
- 18 | they were the managers, Attilio or Marco. Marco did work as a
- 19 | captain but that was told to us by the managers, Brent or
- 20 Attilio.
- 21 | Q. And when he worked as a captain he did the same things that
- 22 | Brent and Attilio do, correct?
- 23 A. He wouldn't make decisions who would work at the stations
- 24 when he would work as a captain, he would only pour the wine,
- 25 serve the wine.

- Salinas cross
- So it is your testimony that when he was a floor captain he 1
- did not -- he did different service-related things than Brent 2
- 3 and Attilio did?
- Repeat that? 4 Α.
- 5 Service-related, serving the customers.
- As a captain he would serve the wine but, I repeat, he 6
- 7 would pour the wine. If a client would want a special bottle
- 8 of wine he would recommend or what type of water they wanted,
- 9 but as a captain it didn't go father than that, from what I
- 10 observed.
- 11 So, Marco did less direct service to the customers than
- Brent and Attilio, is that your testimony? 12
- 13 Α. I believe so, yes.
- 14 I direct your attention, Mr. Salinas, to page 13 of your
- 15 declaration, specifically paragraph 79.
- 16 What page did you say? Α.
- 17 13, paragraph 79; not the deposition, the declaration.
- 18 Now, it is your belief that your co-worker named
- 19 Patricio was terminated by Attilio Vosilla, correct?
- 20 Α. Correct.
- 21 But you don't know who made the decision to terminate him,
- 22 correct?
- 23 At that moment I would think it was the manager because I
- 24 was there and the sous chef told Patricio, Wash the dishes.
- 25 And Patricio said, That is not my job. I'm a stocker.

- Salinas cross
- Raul told Patricio, You don't want to do it? I'm going to go 1
- 2 get the manager. And he went to get the manager and he asked
- 3 him, You do not want to wash the dishes? And Patricio said,
- So then he said, Okay. Get out from here, we do not need 4 No.
- 5 you anymore. I did not see that the manager spoke to someone
- 6 or someone else any further.
- 7 So you don't know whether the sous chef spoke to
- Mr. Scotto, correct? 8
- 9 Correct. Α.
- 10 And you don't know whether Mr. Vosilla talked to
- 11 Mr. Scotto, correct?
- 12 It all happened within three to four minutes. I do not
- 13 know whether he spoke to someone or if they spoke to anyone
- 14 else.
- 15 You worked there seven years, correct, Mr. Salinas?
- 16 Α. Correct.
- 17 And that's the only individual who you even allege was Ο.
- 18 terminated by Mr. Vosilla, correct?
- 19 I did not understand the question. Can you repeat it for Α.
- 20 me?
- 21 You worked in the restaurant for seven years, correct?
- 22 Α. Correct.
- 23 And this is the only time in seven years that you think
- 24 Mr. Vosilla allegedly participated in a decision to terminate
- 25 someone?

- 1 A. Correct.
- 2 | Q. I draw your attention to paragraph 17 of your declaration
- 3 | that starts on page 3. Now, you say that --
- 4 A. You said 17 and it is not here.
- 5 | Q. Paragraph 17 is not there? Page 3, paragraph 17.
- 6 A. Correct.
- 7 Q. You say, and I quote: "Additionally, sometimes when I
- 8 worked as a stocker I was required to do the job of a
- 9 | dishwasher."
- 10 Correct?
- 11 A. Correct.
- 12 Q. So that doesn't happen all the time?
- 13 A. No. No, it didn't happen all the time.
- 14 | Q. In fact, you say at the end on the next page that this
- 15 | would often happen during times when Fresco was less busy such
- 16 as the summer months.
- 17 A. Correct.
- 18 Q. So are we talking about the summer months?
- 19 A. Yes. Correct.
- 20 | Q. And yesterday you said that that happens on Saturdays.
- 21 A. Correct.
- 22 | Q. So we are talking about Saturdays in the summer months,
- 23 correct?
- 24 A. That is so. Correct.
- 25 | Q. Now, you also state in paragraph 17 of your declaration

5

6

7

8

Salinas - cross

- that this happens; after the lunch shift was completed on some 1 days the dishwasher would be sent home around 2:30 p.m. and not 2 3 return until 5:00 p.m.
 - Is that correct?
 - That is correct but not specifically on Saturdays. It was also Fridays. It was Fridays and Saturdays.
 - Q. And so, it is your testimony now that happened on both Fridays and Saturdays?
- 9 Yes. Normally Saturdays, but Fridays also.
- 10 Because there is no lunch shift on Saturday, correct,
- 11 Mr. Salinas?
- 12 Α. Correct. There is not. This is not. There isn't one for 13 lunch.
- 14 Q. Okay. So, is it your testimony -- strike that.
- 15 Mr. Salinas, there have been times when you called in 16 sick, correct?
- 17 Correct. Α.
- 18 And you were never disciplined for that, correct?
- 19 Α. Correct.
- 20 Now, going back to the dish washing, is it your allegation
- 21 that you would wash dishes during the whole time that you were
- 22 employed?
- 23 No, not all the time. Α.
- 24 Ο. No, I mean all the years.
- 25 It started in 2008 to tell us that we would have to wash Α.

dishes.

1

- And did it happen after 2008 as well?
- 3 A. Yes. From there onwards until I ended my relationship as a
- 4 worker at Fresco.
- 5 Q. Now, going back to your declaration in paragraph 17, in the
- 6 second sentence you say: After the lunch shift was completed
- 7 the dishwasher would be sent home around 2:30. So, is it your
- testimony that the lunch shift was completed at 2:30 and then 8
- 9 the dishwasher would leave?
- 10 A. He would send the dishwasher back to his house, but as I
- 11 was working as a stocker he would tell me there are not many
- 12 clients, wash dishes. Wash dishes. Do not worry.
- 13 worry. The same thing happened with the stocker that was there
- 14 during the afternoons: Wash dishes. There are not many
- people. When the dishwasher arrives between 6:00 and 7:00 p.m. 15
- you leave and then you can do your job as a stocker. You 16
- 17 get -- you go back on the Fridays.
- 18 MR. BENSON: Move to strike as non-responsive, your
- 19 Honor.
- 20 THE COURT: Sustained.
- 21 BY MR. BENSON:
- 22 So, is it your testimony that there were times when the
- 23 lunch shift ended at 2:30?
- 24 Normally it was at 3:00, 3:30. Α.
- 25 So, is this not accurate when it says the dishwasher would

- be sent home at 2:30 after the shift was completed?
- A. No. My shift would end at 3:30 and the manager, Brent, 2
- 3 would tell me: Wash dishes. Wash dishes, there is not much to
- do. Wash dishes. You take care of your station, you watch out 4
- 5 after your station and you wash dishes. And the same thing
- 6 would happen when the stocker would arrive at 4:00, he would
- 7 tell him the same thing: Wash dishes until the dishwasher
- would arrive at 6:30, 6:00, 7:00. 8
 - That is what happened.
- 10 MR. BENSON: Move to strike as non-responsive, your
- 11 Honor.

- 12 THE COURT: I just want to remind you, Mr. Salinas, to
- 13 listen to the question and answer the question that is before
- 14 you.
- 15 The answer is stricken.
- 16 MR. BENSON: Could the court reporter please read back
- 17 the last question?
- 18 (Record read)
- 19 A. My shift would end at 3:30. The sous chef would send him
- 20 back at 2:30.
- 21 So it is not accurate, you said here, that the shift was
- 22 completed at 2:30?
- 23 A. No. My shift always, 3:30.
- 24 Q. Now, at Fresco Restaurant all the bussers wore the same
- 25 clothes, correct?

- 1 A. Correct.
- 2 Q. Black shoes, black pants, a button down shirt; correct?
- 3 A. Correct.
- 4 Q. And these are clothes that you could wear as a personal
- 5 matter if you so chose?
- 6 A. Correct.
- 7 Q. Now, it is your testimony that you were required to
- 8 purchase shirts, correct? Shirts?
- 9 A. Correct.
- 10 | Q. And is it your testimony that for the entire time you
- 11 | worked at Fresco Restaurant you were required to pay for
- 12 | shirts?
- 13 A. Correct.
- 14 | Q. And that you never received those shirts for free?
- 15 | A. Never.
- 16 Q. How did you pay for those shirts?
- 17 | A. Well, he would give us two shirts and a tie for \$50.
- 18 | Q. Who is he?
- 19 I apologize. Perhaps you misunderstood me. You just
- 20 said, "He would charge \$50." I want to know who you were
- 21 referring to.
- 22 A. The manager, Brent. And we would pay -- at the office we
- 23 would pay Natasha.
- 24 | Q. So, it is your testimony that Brent gave you the shirts?
- 25 A. That is so.

- 1 Q. It wasn't Willy?
- 2 A. Sometimes Willy also.
- 3 \parallel Q. Who is Willy?
- 4 A. I think that it was a person who took care of maintenance
- 5 | at the restaurant.
- 6 Q. Willy speaks Spanish, does he not?
- 7 \blacksquare A. That is so.
- 8 Q. So, it is your testimony that Brent and Willy gave you
- 9 | these shirts? Did they ask you for any money when they gave
- 10 you those shirts?
- 11 A. They would tell us that we had to go and pay Natasha,
- 12 | though, \$50.
- 13 | Q. Okay. And who is Natasha?
- 14 A. And I think that she works for them at the office or she
- 15 | takes care of the control, I don't know, of what must be paid
- 16 to the delivery or for the delivery. I do not know, but she
- 17 | would always collect from all of us, from all the busboys and
- 18 | the runners and also from the waiters.
- 19 Q. Would she collect all at once?
- 20 A. No. If we wanted an extra tie, she would charge us \$15 or
- 21 you could pay it by installments.
- 22 | Q. You could pay installments?
- 23 INTERPRETER: Little by little were his precise words,
- 24 | counselor.
- 25 | Q. Would that be a reduction on your check?

EC95sal1

- 1 No. It was to pay in cash. Otherwise, they wouldn't
- 2 provide you with a shirt.
- 3 So they told you you had to pay in cash?
- That is so. 4 Α.
- 5 Did you ever get a receipt?
- 6 Α. No.
- 7 Did you ever ask for one?
- We asked but they were never given. But, well, in my case 8
- 9 I was never provided with a receipt.
- 10 Q. And if Natasha testifies that she never charged anybody for
- 11 a shirt, she would be lying?
- 12 I do not believe that more than 20 workers would lie, or
- 13 the bussers and the runners and the waiters, because we all
- 14 paid \$50.
- 15 Q. Okay. Now, your complaint said that you paid \$30 for a
- shirt? 16
- 17 Α. No.
- 18 Is that wrong? Q.
- 19 No. No, we were given two shirts and a tie for \$50. Α.
- 20 Did you read the --0.
- 21 If you needed an additional shirt it was \$17.50.
- 22 So, at no time were you ever charged \$30 for a shirt,
- 23 correct?
- 24 I believe so. I believe the first time, yes, because it
- 25 was one shirt and one tie and this was every -- every six

- 1 | months we would change the color and we would change the tie.
- 2 | Q. Did you ever pay \$30 for a shirt?
- 3 A. That I can recall, yes, the first time.
- 4 Q. So it is your testimony that the first time you were
- 5 charged \$30 for a single shirt?
- 6 A. Yes; and the tie.
- 7 | Q. And what year was that?
- 8 A. In 2006.
- 9 | Q. So it was the shirt and the tie for \$30?
- 10 A. That is what they collected from me, charged me for it.
- 11 | Q. And that was only once?
- 12 A. Yes. Yes. The rest of the years it was \$50 for two shirts
- 13 and one tie.
- 14 MR. BENSON: I have no further questions at this time.
- 15 | THE COURT: Redirect?
- 16 | REDIRECT EXAMINATION
- 17 BY MR. ANDROPHY:
- 18 Q. Good morning, Mr. Salinas.
- 19 A. Good morning.
- 20 | Q. Do you recall yesterday Mr. Benson asked you if all the
- 21 | Fresco employees worked together as a team to provide service,
- 22 correct?
- 23 A. Correct.
- 24 | Q. And you said they do, correct?
- 25 A. Correct.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

14

Salinas - redirect EC95sal1

- Now, do the Fresco employees work as a team by regularly doing each others' jobs like, for example, the busboy doing the job of a food runner?
 - INTERPRETER: Busboys?
- Busboys doing the job of a food runner?
 - A. Correct, but each one had their own tasks, jobs. I would think that each player -- in this case each person had their own job. I do not understand why they are trying to say that the coffee maker would run food or would do the job of the
- 11 Q. So, is it your testimony that if you were working as a 12 stocker you mostly did the work of a stocker? Is that your 13 testimony?

busboy. Many a time we did not have enough time.

- MR. BENSON: Objection to the leading, your Honor.
- THE COURT: Sustained. 15
- So, this is a direct examination so you can't lead. 16
- 17 MR. ANDROPHY: Okay.
- BY MR. ANDROPHY: 18
- 19 Q. Were there specific assignments at Fresco for the employees 20 who worked as busboys?
- 21 Α. Correct.
- 22 And as an employee did you do the assignments you were 23 given?
- 24 Α. Correct.
- 25 Q. Okay.

EC95sal1

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

12

13

14

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

You were also asked about whether there are better tips if there is good service. Do you recall that, if there is good service?

- That is so. Α.
- Are there more tips if the food is good?

MR. BENSON: Objection, your Honor.

THE COURT: Overruled.

You can answer, if you know.

THE WITNESS: No.

- 10 BY MR. ANDROPHY:
- 11 Q. Okay.

You were asked about when you worked as a stocker and whether you had to bring food out to tables. Do you recall that?

- 15 A. Yes. Yes, I remember.
- Would it happen on every shift that you would be required 16 to take food out when you were working as a stocker? 17
 - A. No. Sometimes. I think that perhaps seven or eight times.

But as a percentage of the time. What THE COURT: percentage of the time?

THE WITNESS: Are you referring to minutes?

THE COURT: No. I'm saying as a percentage of your whole shift, so you could say 50 percent, 70 percent, 15 percent.

THE WITNESS: No, it is only -- it is only 3, 4

EC95sall Salinas - redirect

- 1 percent.
- 2 BY MR. ANDROPHY:
- 3 | Q. Is that 3 or 4 percent of a shift you would be taking out
- 4 food?
- 5 A. Correct.
- Q. How about as the coffee person; what percentage of the
- 7 | shift would the coffee person take food out?
- 8 A. I think that it is the same. The same. No, not much time.
- 9 Perhaps seven minutes during the whole shift.
- THE COURT: But as a percentage of the shift, how
- 11 much?
- 12 | THE WITNESS: Almost -- a little bit more because they
- 13 would send the coffee maker more to take the food over there,
- 14 | almost 5 percent or -- not more.
- 15 BY MR. ANDROPHY:
- 16 \parallel Q. When you worked as a stocker, how often did you have to
- 17 reset a table?
- 18 | A. About --
- 19 THE COURT: Counsel, as the finder of fact it is
- 20 percent of the time that is meaningful because I don't know how
- 21 many minutes there are in a shift.
- 22 THE WITNESS: Okay --
- 23 | THE COURT: And I am speaking to the attorney.
- 24 THE WITNESS: Sorry.
- 25 BY MR. ANDROPHY:

EC95sal1

1

2

3

4

5

7

9

14

15

Let me ask you a question.

When you worked as a stocker, did you have to reset a table on every shift that you worked as a stocker?

- Perhaps once or less than 1 percent, I would think, or 1 percent. It could be 1 percent. It could happen once during
- the whole shift. 6
 - To be clear I'm asking did it happen on every shift.
- 8 Α. No.
 - Approximately how often did it happen on a shift? Ο.
- 10 Two, three times, but not much time. Α.
- 11 Is that two or three shifts over your entire period of work 12 or is that over a specific period of time?
- 13 MR. BENSON: Objection. Asked and answered.
 - THE COURT: Counselor, I am the finder of fact so you need to ask questions that are going to be meaningful to me.
- 16 BY MR. ANDROPHY:
- 17 Q. On the shifts where you had to set a table as a stocker,
- 18 approximately what percentage of your shift was spent doing
- 19 that?
- 20 Α. 1 percent.
- 21 Do you recall you were asked about jobs of the coffee
- 22 person and the coffee helper?
- 23 Α. Correct. Yes.
- 24 Can you clarify what the job of the coffee person was and
- 25 what the job of the coffee helper was?

Α. Okay.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MR. BENSON: Object to the form of the question. is two questions.

THE COURT: So just do one at a time.

What is the job of the coffee preparer? We will do that one first.

You can answer, sir.

THE WITNESS: Okay. The coffee maker was in charge of to prepare coffee, to make coffees, tea at the time the service had to be made, served, and then the tickets would appear there for him so that he would see how many coffees he would have to prepare at that moment; and iced teas. Iced teas and all of that, he would prepare or get the sugars ready and do it, place everything on a tray with the corresponding ticket to see to which table it was going to go to. That is what the coffee maker would mainly do.

And with regards to the stocker, I am sorry, excuse me --

THE COURT: No, the next one is the assistant, the helper to the coffee maker.

THE WITNESS: Yes.

When they were on the tray the helper, the assistant or the helper would take it over to the corresponding table according to the ticket and to the corresponding person because one cannot ask who ordered coffee and who did not. But,

Salinas - redirect

- instead, in the ticket it is specified, the position of each
 person, place where each person is appropriately there, and the
 helper was the one who would come in and out because the coffee
 maker had to remain preparing espressos, coffee, and
 everything. He was always there. This is an area where only
 the coffee maker would work and the helper was at a table
 behind and he would place everything there so that he would
- 9 BY MR. ANDROPHY:
- 10 | Q. Thank you.

8

Do you recall being asked if sometimes there were runners or waiters who were assigned as the late runner and late waiter?

take it -- so that the helper would take it.

- 14 A. Yes. Correct.
- 15 | Q. Were you ever a food runner or a waiter?
- 16 | A. No.
- Q. Did you concern yourself with knowing the schedules for the runners and the waiters?
- 19 A. Not exactly.
- 20 Q. Okay.
- You spoke today about side work that you did at the beginning of your shift, correct?
- 23 A. Correct.
- Q. And did side work always take the same amount of time each day?

EC95sall Salinas - redirect

- 1 A. Yes. Correct.
- Q. Was Anthony Scotto always at the restaurant for the entire
- 3 | shift?
- 4 A. Not always. No.
- 5 | Q. Did he sometimes leave before it closed?
- 6 A. Normally he would leave at 9:00 p.m.
- 7 | Q. And would someone be in charge after he left?
- 8 A. Yes. If Brent was there it was Brent, but normally Attilio
- 9 was the one, because he would -- the orders, the checks from
- 10 the waiters, the chits -- the orders that the waiters have, the
- 11 orders, the little pieces of paper for the chits.
- 12 MR. ANDROPHY: I think it is chits, I think C-H-I-T-S.
- 13 | THE COURT: I said it right from the beginning,
- 14 fortunately.
- 15 BY MR. ANDROPHY:
- 16 | Q. When you first started working at Fresco, did you meet
- 17 | Anthony Scotto?
- 18 | A. No.
- 19 | Q. Did you meet him the first day you worked there?
- 20 A. No. I believe it was on the second day.
- 21 | Q. You testified earlier that Brent Drill was a manager?
- 22 INTERPRETER: Brent Grill?
- 23 \parallel Q. Drill, D-R-I-L-L; how do you know that he was a manager?
- 24 A. Because when I arrived there asking about the job, the
- 25 person that was at the front as a hostess, I asked whether the

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

- manager was there. And he or she said wait for a moment and Mr. Brent came over towards me and he asked me where I had worked. And he read the paper and he said, okay, come over tomorrow for training and he told me that it was going to be three days for training only and that is the way it was. And I asked, Who should I ask for tomorrow? And he said I'm going to be here. Do not worry, I am going to be here. Don't worry. am the manager here. Okay.
 - So then that happened during the first day.
- During that conversation with Brent Drill, did Mr. Drill ever leave your conversation to go speak with anyone else?
- 12 That happened only -- I only spoke to him four five 13 minutes but not more than that.
- 14 Q. You testified today about when you saw an employee named 15 Patricio who was fired. Do you recall that?
- 16 Yes. Correct.
- 17 And when Mr. Vosilla came to speak with Patricio, did he 18 leave that conversation to go speak with anyone else?
 - No. Only I only saw him and Patricio. Α.
- 20 Did you ever receive any directions at work from Marion 21 Scotto?
- 22 Α. Yes, sometimes.
- 23 What types of directions would you receive from her? 0.
- 24 Regarding or at the section or part that is the bar area.
- 25 There are many, many times. They have private bars at the bar

15

16

Salinas - redirect

- area and sometimes one has to -- one has to serve appetizers to 1 quests before they sit down to eat and sometimes she would send 2 3 us to serve the appetizers such as calamari, pizza. If she
- 4 would say a busboy she would say -- she would say -- but, yes, 5 she would tell us and send us to do those things.
 - And how often was she at the restaurant?
- 7 Well, during the mornings she arrives at 10:00 also and she would leave approximately at 3:00 p.m. She would leave and she 8 9 would come back at 5:00 p.m.
- 10 Was that every day that the restaurant was open?
- 11 Α. Yes. That is so.
- 12 Did you ever see her interviewing anyone for a job?
- 13 I would think so only for the hostesses. Α.

That is so.

- 14 You testified earlier about sometimes when the dishwasher Q.

Yes.

would be sent home.

- 17 When the dishwasher was sent home, would that be the end of 18 your shift or the dishwasher's shift?
- No. At the end of his shift he was sent home and I would 19 20 remain until the end of my shift, 3:30.
- 21 MR. ANDROPHY: Thank you. I have no further 22 questions.
- 23 THE COURT: Recross?
- 24 MR. BENSON: Can I have five minutes?
- 25 THE COURT: Yes.

1	(counsel conferring)
2	MR. BENSON: I have no questions, your Honor.
3	THE COURT: Mr. Salinas, I have a question for you.
4	How old are you?
5	THE WITNESS: 54 years old.
6	THE COURT: And how long have you been working? From
7	what age?
8	THE WITNESS: I started when I was 18 years old.
9	THE COURT: What do you do now for a living?
10	THE WITNESS: I work as a busboy.
11	THE COURT: Thank you. You may step down.
12	THE WITNESS: I would like to make a commentary.
13	THE COURT: Unfortunately, sir, you answer the
14	questions but you can't offer commentary.
15	THE WITNESS: Okay. That is all right. Perfect.
16	THE COURT: You may step down.
17	THE WITNESS: Okay.
18	(witness steps down)
19	THE COURT: You may call your next witness.
20	MR. ANDROPHY: Plaintiffs call Christian Urgiles.
21	CHRISTIAN URGILES,
22	called as a witness by the Plaintiffs,
23	having been duly sworn, testified through the interpreter,
24	as follows:
25	MR. ANDROPHY: May I approach and hand him his

EC95sal1 Salinas - redirect

1 | declaration?

2 THE COURT: You may.

3 DIRECT EXAMINATION

- 4 BY MR. ANDROPHY:
- 5 Q. Good morning, Mr. Urgiles.
- 6 A. Good morning.
- 7 Q. The document that I just handed you, is that your
- 8 declaration for this trial?
- 9 | A. Yes.
- 10 | Q. And if you turn to the last page, is that your signature?
- 11 | A. Yes.
- 12 | Q. And by signing this do you agree that this should be your
- 13 direct testimony at this trial?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 MR. ANDROPHY: We ask that the declaration of
- 16 Mr. Urgiles be admitted as Plaintiff's Exhibit 105.
- 17 THE COURT: Any objection?
- 18 MS. KABIR: No objection.
- 19 THE COURT: It is admitted.
- 20 | (Plaintiff's Exhibit 105 received in evidence)
- 21 MR. ANDROPHY: And we also ask that Plaintiff's
- 22 | Exhibits 68, 69 and 70 be admitted into evidence. These are
- 23 documents that Mr. Urgiles identifies in his declaration.
- 24 | THE COURT: Any objection?
- 25 MR. BENSON: Just give me one second to check?

MR. ANDROPHY: Paragraphs 96, 97 and 98.

MS. KABIR: No objection.

THE COURT: They are admitted.

(Plaintiff's Exhibits 68, 69 and 70 received in

evidence)

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

MR. ANDROPHY: We have no further questions and turn it over to defendant for cross-examination.

THE COURT: Cross-examination.

CROSS EXAMINATION

10 BY MS. KABIR:

- 11 Q. Good morning, Mr. Urgiles. I am sorry if I am not
- 12 pronouncing your name correctly.
- 13 A. Good morning.
- 14 | Q. Mr. Urgiles, you worked as a busser at Fresco; isn't that
- 15 | correct?
- 16 | A. Yes.
- 17 THE COURT: Ms. Kabir, if you would bring that mic
- 18 closer to you so that you can be heard?
- 19 MS. KABIR: Is that better?
- 20 THE COURT: Yes.
- 21 BY MS. KABIR:
- 22 | Q. Since you left Fresco in April 2013, have you been working
- 23 | at another restaurant?
- 24 A. Yes. Correct.
- 25 Q. What is the name of the restaurant?

EC95sal1 Urgiles - cross

- 1 A. Papillon Bistro.
- 2 | Q. And are you a busser at Papillon Bistro?
- 3 A. No. I'm not a busser anymore.
- 4 | Q. What is your position there?
- 5 | A. There I work as a food runner, and a waiter sometimes.
- 6 Q. Before you left Fresco in April 2013, were you also working
- 7 | shifts at another restaurant?
- 8 A. Yes, Miss.
- 9 Q. Was it at Papillon Bistro?
- 10 A. Correct.
- 11 INTERPRETER: Could he be instructed to please not
- 12 | answer until I finish my translation, please?
- 13 | THE COURT: Please allow him to finish.
- 14 BY MS. KABIR:
- 15 Q. By the time you left Fresco in April 2013, you were working
- 16 there only one or two shifts a week; isn't that correct?
- 17 A. That is not correct.
- 18 Q. How many shifts a week were you working?
- 19 A. Five shifts.
- 20 Q. Five shifts per week.
- 21 And what days were you working?
- 22 A. Mondays, Tuesdays and Fridays.
- 23 | Q. And you had Wednesdays and Thursdays off, isn't that
- 24 | correct?
- 25 A. Correct.

EC95sal1

- And you always had Wednesdays and Thursdays off when you were working at Fresco, isn't that right?
- 3 Correct. Α.
- 4 That's from the time you started at the restaurant? Q.
- 5 Α. No.

1

2

- For how long then? 6 Ο.
- 7 I'm not recalling very well, but more or less about five or six years. I do not remember well. 8
- 9 I would like you to take a look at your statement that was 10 marked Plaintiff's Exhibit 105. If you could turn to page 6 11 and look at paragraph 30?
- 12 INTERPRETER: Paragraph?
- 13 0. 30.

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

- It says: My schedule at Fresco varied throughout my employment. Before June 2011 I usually worked approximately seven to 11 shifts per week.
- Is it your testimony that you worked 11 shifts per week when you had Wednesdays and Thursdays off?
- I'm going to tell you something. Sometimes the A. Okay. manager would ask me for me to work Fridays and Saturdays in the evenings on Saturdays.
- Q. So you would usually work five shifts a week, is that your testimony, correct, but sometimes you would work additional shifts on Fridays and Saturdays?
- 25 Α. Correct.

- Q. So, is this statement in paragraph 30 of your declaration,
- 2 | should it be corrected to say five to seven shifts per week?
- 3 A. When I started there I started working there 11 shifts.
 - Q. And what year was that?
- 5 A. If I remember right it was 2005.
- Q. So since 2006 you worked five to seven shifts; is that your testimony?
 - A. Excuse me. I did not understand your question.
- 9 Q. So, I'm asking since 2006, is it your testimony that you worked between five and seven shifts per week?
- 11 A. No. From 2005 or 2006, if I remember when I started
- 12 | working there, I started working 11 shifts. Afterwards, when I
- 13 | found myself another job because, I saw that there they would
- 14 | make us do a lot of jobs and wouldn't give us opportunities, I
- 15 | found -- I went back to my previous job.
- 16 | Q. So, since you started working a second job you hadn't
- 17 | worked 11 shifts a week at Fresco?
- 18 | A. No. No, Miss.
- THE COURT: What do you mean they weren't giving you opportunities?
- 21 THE WITNESS: Because never did they -- if they would
- 22 | need or require a runner, the busboys who worked a lot of time
- 23 would not grant them this position or give them that position.
- 24 | They would hire -- they would prefer to hire a different person
- 25 | to give those shifts to him, to that person.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

THE COURT: Would you consider the runner shift a more desirable shift?

THE WITNESS: Well, yes, because it is a bit more money and if one has a family, well, one is looking for something better.

BY MS. KABIR:

Q. Mr. Urgiles, in paragraph 31 on page 6 of your declaration it says: When I worked a lunch shift I would arrive at 10:00 a.m. and work until approximately 3:30 p.m.

Was that true the whole time you worked at Fresco? If you were asking me about this question I'm going to reply about that, yes, but when I -- when I started at Fresco, we never had time to leave for our break and we never had a set time to leave to go back home.

MS. KABIR: Move to strike as non-responsive.

THE COURT: Sustained. Stricken.

And, Ms. Kabir, if you would raise your voice or bring the mic closer to you?

MS. KABIR: Okay. I apologize, your Honor.

BY MS. KABIR:

Q. Mr. Urgiles, I want to know if your lunch shift at Fresco always lasted from 10:00 a.m. until 3:30 p.m.

Is that your testimony today?

- Α. Yes.
 - The next sentence says: I could not leave until the last

EC95sal1

1

2

3

4

7

8

9

10

customer left, so the time I left would vary.

Is it your testimony that sometimes you left before 3:30?

- Never could I leave before 3:30. Α.
- 5 Q. Mr. Urgiles, were you ever assigned to be the late busser 6 when you were working at Fresco?

(Record read)

- Yes. Α.
- And when you were the late busser, were you the last busser Ο. who had to stay for the lunch shift?
- 11 I can answer that question to you but I can explain it to 12 you. Yes, we would leave at that time but that happened, but 13 then afterwards -- but that lapsed, and then after 2011,
- 14 because they gave us a schedule with set, scheduled, hourly 15 times who would close and who would not close. Previously we
- 16 did not have that.
- 17 So, is it your testimony that prior to 2011 you were never 18 assigned on the schedule to be the late busser? Is that right?
- 19 Before 2011, no. Α.
- 20 Is it your testimony that before 2011 all of the bussers 21 had to stay until the last customer left?
- 22 Α. Yes.
- 23 I would like to show you an exhibit that's been premarked as Defendant's Exhibit A. I am going to bring copies for the 24 25 translator and for the witness.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

11

If you open up the exhibit binder you will see that the first page is page numbers in the left-hand column that are printed in the top right-hand corner of each schedule. If you could please turn to page Exhibit A-5?

THE COURT: This is an exhibit that I have also?

MS. KABIR: Yes; it should be in the defendant's exhibit binder as the first exhibit.

THE COURT: What page are you on?

MS. KABIR: Page A-5 in the top right-hand corner.

10 BY MS. KABIR:

- Q. Mr. Urgiles, is your name listed as "Christian" under the
- busser's column on the schedule? 12
- 13 Correct, Miss. Α.
- 14 Q. And if you look on the schedule for the shift under Friday,
- 15 February 6 it says L close, correct?
- 16 Α. No.
- 17 What does it say then? Ο.
- 18 It says L. It says L. Α.
- 19 Are you looking on page A-5? Q.
- 20 INTERPRETER: 8 or A-5?
- 21 MS. KABIR: A-5.
- 22 Α. Yes. Correct. Now I see it.
- 23 (continued on next page)

24

EC9ASAL2ps

Urgiles - cross

- Q. So when you were scheduled for L close, that means you were the closing busser during lunch; isn't that right?
 - A. Correct.

3

7

8

9

10

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

- Q. So if the customers in the other sections of the dining
 room left the section, then the other bussers could leave their
 shift when their section was empty, correct?
 - A. Yes, correct.
 - Q. So as a closing busser for this one shift, you were required to wait until the end of the shift when all the other customers had left; isn't that right?
- 11 A. Correct.
- 12 | Q. But the other bussers could leave earlier?
- 13 A. Not all the time, because we had to -- during the busy 14 time, nobody could leave early, only during the summertime.
 - Q. I'm just asking based on the schedule. The other bussers were not scheduled to close, did not have to stay through another shift based on this schedule. Isn't that right?
 - THE INTERPRETER: I'm sorry. I missed that completely.
 - Q. The other bussers listed on the schedule who were not listed as a closing busser for the lunch shift, they were not obligated to stay in the dining room until the last customer left; only the closing busser was, correct?
- 24 A. Yes, that's correct.
 - Q. And if you continue looking on that page for Saturday,

EC9ASAL2ps

- 1 there's two Xs. Does that mean you have that day off,
- 2 requested?
- 3 Correct, Miss. Α.
- 4 So every week, you would not be scheduled for a Saturday 0.
- 5 shift, when this was noted on your schedule; isn't that right?
- A. Correct. 6
- 7 And the same goes for Wednesdays and Thursdays; isn't that
- 8 right?
- 9 A. Correct, but as I told you, always the manager would ask us
- 10 if we would want to work, or whether you could work, so then
- 11 one would accept.
- 12 So you were not available to work on Wednesdays, Thursdays,
- 13 or Saturdays; is that right?
- 14 A. Correct.
- 15 0. And if these schedules indicated that you were the closing
- busser, you were the closing busser for any shift that you 16
- 17 worked prior to 2011, is it still your testimony that all of
- 18 the bussers were obligated to stay until the last customer left
- the dining room? 19
- 20 A. Well, Miss, when I started working there, we did not have a
- 21 schedule as we have after, we had afterwards, after what -- as
- 22 the -- on account of the problems that Mr. Scotto had, I don't
- 23 know what happened. But then we were provided with a schedule
- 24 about who would open and who would close.
- 25 Mr. Urgiles, isn't it true that, after the restaurant

- Urgiles cross
- implemented a time clock, they would print the actual times on 1 the schedules? 2
- 3 Yes, Miss. Α.
- 4 So when the schedules just say "L close," that means there Q.
- 5 was no time clock at the restaurant, but you were still
- assigned to be the closing busser for the one shift, correct? 6
- 7 A. We would arrive and then the ones who would close, we would
- leave at -- we would arrive at 10:30 -- I'm sorry -- at 11. 8
- 9 would arrive at 11. And those who would open would come in at
- 10 10 a.m.
- 11 So if the schedule said "L close," like on page A-5, you
- 12 knew that your shift started at 11 a.m., not 10 a.m.; isn't
- 13 that right?
- 14 A. Correct.
- 15 0. So is it your testimony that before 2011, your lunch shift
- would typically start at 10 a.m., unless you were scheduled to 16
- 17 be the closing busser, in which case it started at 11 a.m.
- instead? 18
- 19 Did you say 10 or 10:30? Excuse me. I did not hear you.
- 20 I'm asking you if your testimony is that prior to 2011,
- 21 your lunch shift started at 10 a.m. unless you were scheduled
- 22 to be the closing busser; isn't that right?
- 23 Α. Correct.
- 24 Would you be sometimes scheduled to be the closing
- 25 busser during the dinner shifts as well?

Α. No.

- So during dinner shifts, since you were never scheduled to 2 Q.
- 3 close, your shift ended when the rest of the customers in your
- 4 section were gone; isn't that right?
- 5 A. Yes, correct.
- 6 If you turn to page 7 of your statement -- of your
- 7 declaration, my apologies -- and look at paragraph 34 on page
- 7, it says, "On Saturdays I would work approximately from 3 8
- 9 p.m. to 12 a.m., though the end time varied depending on when
- 10 the last customers left the restaurant." You previously
- 11 testified that you requested not to work on Saturdays; isn't
- 12 that right?
- 13 A. Yes, correct.
- 14 So is this paragraph, 34, incorrect? Q.
- I am going to --15 Α.
- I am not asking for an explanation. I'm just asking you, 16
- 17 is this paragraph correct?
- 18 A. Yes, it is correct.
- 19 So even though you requested never to work on Saturdays,
- 20 you still worked from 3 p.m. to midnight. Mr. Urgiles, isn't
- 21 it true that you rarely worked Saturdays?
- 22 A. Yes, correct. When, when -- when I found the other job,
- 23 but previously I would work all shifts.
- 24 Q. And when you worked on Saturdays, you only had to stay
- 25 until the end of the shift if you were the closing busser;

- isn't that right? 1
- A. No, ma'am. Previously, there were -- there was no closer. 2
- 3 All busboys, we all had -- we would all close. Only the ones
- 4 that schedule close were the waiters and the runners.
- 5 That's every Saturday? Ο.
- That was all, every day, every, all days. 6
- 7 Is it your testimony that you were working during the
- 8 entire time?
- 9 Α. Yes.
- 10 You never finished your shift early and waited around for
- 11 your tips?
- 12 Α. No, ma'am.
- 13 So is it your testimony that even though there's an empty 0.
- 14 dining room, or only one customer at a table, at 9 p.m. on a
- 15 Saturday night, all of the bussers had to stay until midnight?
- 16 Yes, ma'am. Α.
- 17 So is it your testimony there would be seven bussers
- 18 standing around an empty dining room between 9 p.m. and
- 19 midnight every Saturday?
- 20 A. Yes, ma'am.
- 21 Mr. Urgiles, you testified that as a busser for Fresco, you
- 22 worked as a coffee preparer, correct?
- 23 Α. Correct.
- 24 And when you were a coffee preparer, you also testified
- 25 that one of the things you did was slice the bread for the

- bread basket. Isn't that correct?
- 2 Α. Correct.

- 3 And was this so that the busboys could spend less time
- preparing the bread basket before they brought it to the table? 4
- 5 I do not understand the question, ma'am.
- So when you were the coffee preparer, you were assigned to 6
- 7 the coffee station; isn't that correct?
- Correct. 8 Α.
- 9 And the coffee station at Fresco is located right next to
- 10 the station where the bread is for the bread baskets; isn't
- 11 that right?
- 12 Α. Correct, ma'am.
- 13 So during the early part of your shift when you were
- 14 waiting for iced tea and coffee orders to print at the coffee
- 15 station, you helped the bussers by preparing the bread baskets
- at the bread station, correct? 16
- 17 A. No, ma'am. I did not have enough time for that.
- 18 would do is, we would load or take up the bread in order to
- heat it up or warm it up, because we did not have enough time 19
- 20 to do other things.
- 21 I'd like to direct you to page 5 of your declaration,
- 22 paragraph no. 26. It says, "Sometimes I was assigned to work
- 23 at the coffee station preparing coffee, tea, and iced tea.
- 24 When I worked at the coffee station, I had to prepare iced tea,
- 25 bring milk upstairs to the station, bring ice upstairs to the

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

25

station, bring all the ingredients for coffee, espresso, tea, and iced tea upstairs and to the coffee station, cut lemons, bring up and polish spoons, cut bread for the busser to take to table, cut butter, and bring bean dip from downstairs to the station, and fill sugar containers." Is that an accurate statement?

- That is correct, but when one says "cut the bread," it does not mean that we were actually preparing the basket for the busboys. To cut the bread was to cut it halfway, in half, in order to put it in the basket so then it would be easier to be cut.
- Q. So you would agree, then, by making it easier for the busser, you helped the bussers bring the bread to the tables more quickly, by having the sliced bread ready for them at the bread station; isn't that right?
- I do not know whether that was a help for my fellow workers. But none. I also worked as a busboy. I never had enough time in order to, to say, in the way that you're saying, whether we had time. I do not understand what time you're referring to, for the busboys, when, if the busboys had time.
- Q. All I'm asking you, Mr. Urgiles, is, when you were the coffee preparer, you helped the busboys by getting the bread station ready, correct?
- 24 Α. Correct. Correct.
 - And the bean dip, that you were referring to the bread

station, that's also for the bread baskets that the bussers 1 served to the tables; isn't that right? 2

- I would just take the bean dip upstairs. I would not prepare it.
- You would bring it to the bread station; isn't that right?
- Α. Correct. 6

3

4

5

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

25

And when you worked as a --Q.

THE COURT: One moment.

THE INTERPRETER: Can the interpreter be heard? I would like to just to precise my translation into Spanish. When he says subir, does he just mean to put the bread inside? Can I ask him what he means?

THE COURT: Yes.

THE INTERPRETER: Because it's not clear. (Pause)

All right. So I asked him, because it wasn't clear for me as I'm not familiar with the case, what he meant by subir, which means to take up. And her Honor authorized me, so he did explain that they were bringing it physically upstairs from the basement "because we were coming from the basement." Thank you, your Honor.

- Q. When you worked as a coffee preparer, you got more tips from the tip pool than the other bussers for that shift; isn't that right?
- 24 That is true. But it was only a little bit more.

MS. KABIR: There was no question. I'm sorry.

- 1 THE INTERPRETER: I cannot hear two people.
- MS. KABIR: I said there was no question pending so 2
- 3 I'm not sure what Mr. Urgiles was explaining.
 - THE COURT: Are you asking to strike the answer?
- 5 MS. KABIR: Yes.
- THE COURT: The answer is stricken. 6
 - Q. Mr. Urgiles, did you ever work as the coffee preparer on shifts where there was also a coffee helper?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 And usually this was during only lunch shifts; isn't that
- 11 right?

4

7

- 12 Α. Correct.
- 13 Where there was more than 200 reservations in the
- 14 restaurant?
- 15 That's a lie. After -- beyond a hundred and 125
- reservations for the restaurant. 16
- 17 Q. So when the restaurant was busy, then; is that your
- 18 testimony?
- 19 A. Correct.
- 20 O. Because there would be more demand in the restaurant for
- 21 iced tea and coffee and espresso drinks? Isn't that right?
- 22 A. Correct.
- 23 And when you were the coffee preparer, isn't it true that
- 24 you would make the espresso drinks on the espresso machine
- 25 while the coffee helper helped you make the coffee and tea

- drinks on the regular coffee machine, located right next to the 1 2 espresso machine?
- 3 No, ma'am. Α.

The helper --

- There is no question, Mr. Urgiles. Please wait until I ask you a question.
 - Α. No.

4

5

6

7

11

- So is it your testimony that the coffee helper didn't help 8 9 you prepare any drinks during those shifts?
- THE INTERPRETER: 10 The --
 - 0. Prepare any drinks.
- 12 Α. No.
- 13 So that isn't your testimony, or that is your testimony, 0. 14 that the coffee helper does not prepare any drinks during the shifts there is a coffee helper? 15
- Many a time when we were very busy, perhaps 1 percent, 16
- 2 percent, they would help us, but beyond that, no. We did not 18 have time, nor did the helper have time to help me, because
- there were too many coffees, too many espressos, tea, iced tea, 19
- 20 iced coffee.
- 21 The bean dip would be finished. The ice would --22 we needed more bean dip. We needed more ice. And I had to go 23 downstairs and come back upstairs so that the runners could
- 24 take all the orders that we had.
- 25 Let me try to ask this question in a different way. Isn't

- it your testimony that when there was a coffee helper on duty 1
- and you were the coffee preparer, you made all the drinks that 2
- 3 printed out on the tickets at the coffee station? Is that
- 4 right?

- 5 Yes. Α.
- So while you were making all the drinks, was a coffee 6
- 7 helper running food with the runners?
- 8 Α. Sometimes yes.
 - So would the coffee helper also help the busboys run bread? Ο.
- 10 Not many of the times. Α.
- 11 And would the coffee helper help the stocker --
- 12 THE INTERPRETER: The server?
- 13 The stocker -- bring clean dishes and silverware to the
- 14 dining room?
- 15 Α. No.
- So the coffee helper --16 0.
- 17 Excuse me. I did not understand the question.
- 18 I'm asking you if the coffee helper also helped the
- 19 runners, the bussers, and the stocker, in addition to the
- 20 coffee preparer.
- 21 Well, he had to principally help the stocker and the
- 22 runners, and every time that the check required him to do so.
- 23 So the coffee helper helped everybody; isn't that right? 0.
- 24 Α. Correct.
- 25 So if the coffee helper was running food because the chef

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Urgiles - cross

- ordered him to, you would have to bring the iced teas and the 1 coffees to the table; isn't that right? 2
 - No. That is why I had a helper.
- 4 I'm asking you about your helper, the coffee helper. 0. 5 that your testimony?
- That the coffee helper also helps the runners and the 6 7 bussers and the stockers? I do not understand your question, ma'am. 8
 - Q. You previously testified that on shifts there was a coffee helper when you were working as a coffee preparer, the coffee helper also helped the runners run food and helped the stocker and helped the busboys, correct?
 - A. Yes, correct.
 - So I'm asking you, if the coffee helper is in the dining room helping the runners, for example, isn't it true that you would have to serve the drinks that you prepared at the coffee station?
 - A. Many of the times I did not have time because there were many, too many coffees, and that is why they would place me -give me or grant me a helper. If the helper would help or was helping or the chef would call him because he needed for him to take -- to serve that food and I was busy, he could not help the chef. He had to help me. Only would he help when we would be having not so much work, a slow time.

THE COURT: When you were working as the coffee

EC9ASAL2ps

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

Urgiles - cross

preparer and you had the helper, what percentage of the helper's time was dedicated exclusively to delivering coffee and tea and iced tea to the tables?

THE WITNESS: 90 percent of the time.

- Q. So is it your testimony that when you were the coffee preparer and you had a helper, you never served the drinks yourself?
- A. Every now and then, yes.

THE COURT: What percent of the time, when you were the coffee maker, did you dedicate to serving at the tables? THE WITNESS: Between 5 and 7 percent.

Q. Would you agree that the percentage of time would vary depending on the shift and the time of, I guess the time window and the shift, like between 12:30 and 1 o'clock, you might be running the coffee 1 percentage --

THE INTERPRETER: 12 percentage?

- You might be running the coffee 5 percent of the time.
- Α. Yes.
- 19 But between 1 p.m. and 2 p.m. on the same shift, you could 20 be running the coffee 20 percent of the time?
- 21 Α. No.
- 22 10 percent of the time? Ο.
- 23 More or less 15 percent. Α.
- 24 Ο. So it varied, depending on the time of the shift.
- 25 Yes, depending what time within the shift. Α.

- Urgiles cross
- 1 The coffee has to be served within ten minutes at Fresco
- Restaurant; isn't that right? 2
- 3 I cannot provide you with a specific time. If you need
- some -- if you need a coffee, the coffee is already made. 4
- you do is, you pour it into the cup, and the helper takes it. 5
- 6 Q. You would agree that it has to be served quickly, right?
- 7 Otherwise the customers would become impatient?
- Depending on how many orders there are. 8
- 9 So if you left the orders pile up at the coffee station,
- 10 they would get cold; isn't that right?
- 11 Α. Correct.
- 12 And the customers would be upset?
- 13 I never saw an upset client. Α.
- 14 Would you have to remake the drinks if they thought that Q.
- the coffee was too cold? 15
- 16 Α. Yes.
- 17 So you would agree it was important to have the coffees
- 18 made and served in a timely manner.
- 19 Α. Correct.
- 20 And that's part of the reason why the coffee preparer gets
- a bigger share of the tip pool; isn't that right? 21
- 22 Α. Correct.
- 23 Q. You also testified that you sometimes worked as a bar-back.
- 24 Isn't that right?
- 25 THE INTERPRETER: Bar-back?

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MS. KABIR: Bar-back.

THE INTERPRETER: Your Honor, I don't know what a bar-back is. The interpreter does not know what a bar-back is.

If the witness is familiar with what a MS. KABIR: bar-back is --

THE COURT: Well, what does a bar-back do?

MS. KABIR: Well, at Fresco Restaurant, the bar-back performs two functions. The first is waiting for anyone serving at the bar and helping restock the bar. And they also provide busser functions to the 15 tables that are located at the front of the restaurant by the bar.

Would the witness agree with that description?

THE INTERPRETER: I said in Spanish, so then let us just call it in English "bar-back," and I asked him whether he understood, because he helps in stocking the bar and other things. Correct?

- So you would help to stock the bar when you were assigned as a bar-back; isn't that right?
- A. Correct.
 - Q. You would stock it with clean glasses and silverware, and also beverages that are served from the bar, like bottled water?
 - MS. KABIR: I said:
- Q. Like beverages stocked at the bar, such as bottled water, sparkling water, ice. So you did restock the bar with those

- items, correct?
- Α. 2 Yes.

- 3 And for customers who decided to eat their meal at the bar,
- 4 you also removed their service items when they had finished
- 5 eating and cleaned the bar, correct?
- Α. Correct. 6
- 7 And you also cleared and reset all of the 15 tables at the
- bar area, correct? 8
- 9 Well, let me say something, before I can give you an
- 10 answer. When we were working at the bar, we had two jobs.
- 11 was as a bar-back, and as, as a busboy. When I would work as a
- bar-back, I would arrive at 10 a.m., and I would clean the 12
- 13 shelves, the glasses, the windows, the glass, windows, the
- 14 bottles. I would have to clean before I would place the
- 15 glasses, to clean and make sure that the place where we would
- place the glasses was clean, and to shine the bar itself, the 16
- 17 counter itself of the bar, to bring ice, if water was required
- 18 to bring water, to clean the entrance doors, to clean the large
- 19 windows, to sweep, to sweep the area of the bar, and to sweep
- 20 the outside part.
- 21 So you would --Q.
- 22 That was my job as a bar-back. And when I needed to clean
- 23 the glass, we would wash the glasses with some hot water that
- 24 was soapy hot water, and then we would clean them till we would
- 25 shine them. When we would work as busboys at the bar, many a

EC9ASAL2ps

- 1 time we did not have time enough not even for ourselves, so
- 2 then we had to help to assist the waiter who was working in the
- 3 outer part.
- So Mr. Urgiles, is it your testimony that you assisted the 4 Q.
- 5 bartender by preparing the bar area for service to customers
- before they came in, and then you also helped assist the 6
- 7 waiters by busing the tables in the bar area; isn't that right?
- 8 Α. Yes, ma'am.
- 9 And the bar area is located at the front of Fresco
- 10 Restaurant, correct, when you walk in the door?
- 11 Α. Correct.
- 12 And all of the walk-in quests are seated in that area;
- 13 isn't that right?
- 14 A. Correct.
- 15 Q. So by noon or 12:30 during the lunch shift, all of the
- tables are pretty much full with walk-in quests on a typical 16
- 17 lunch shift; isn't that right?
- 18 Α. Correct.
- 19 And that's where walk-in guests are also seated during
- 20 dinner; isn't that right?
- 21 Α. Correct.
- 22 And sometimes that area is also used to host private
- 23 parties in the restaurant; isn't that right?
- 24 Α. Correct.
- 25 So when you were the busser assigned to work as a bar-back,

- you had to provide service to all of the tables in the bar 1 area, which were usually full for service; isn't that correct? 2
- 3 Correct. Α.
- 4 All 15 tables? Q.
- 5 There were only 12 tables. Α.
- 12 tables. 6 Ο.
- 7 Α. Correct.
- So when you worked as a bar-back, you spent at least the 8 9 two hours during the peak lunch service assisting the waiters 10 at the tables at the bar, by being the bussers for those
- 11 tables, correct?
- 12 Α. Yes.
- 13 And the same during dinner service, during the busy times Ο. 14 every dinner shift.
- 15 Α. Yes.
- You performed all of your busser duties during those 16 17 periods of the shift. Isn't that right?
- 18 A. Not many of the times, most of the times. To be a bar-back
- there was a job where you really had to run, to bring glasses, 19
- 20 to wash glasses, to dry glasses. I'm talking about the glasses
- 21 that are for expensive bottles. Yes. And I did help, I did
- 22 help the waiters when I had a little bit of time and I didn't
- 23 have many glasses to wash.
- 24 So when you were getting the glasses for the bar, as a
- 25 bar-back, who was bussing the tables at the tables located in

the bar section?

- A. Many a time the waiters, they themselves would take them 2
- 3 out, bring them out. But we would, we would, we would have to
- 4 help them many a time because they would tell us, if you do not
- 5 help me, I'm going to speak to the managers, or with Anthony.
- 6 Q. So you would help the waiters and you would help the
- 7 bartenders, and then the waiters sometimes took over and helped
- you; isn't that right? 8
- 9 A. Never.
- 10 You didn't just testify that the waiters sometimes bussed
- the tables in the bar section themselves? 11
- 12 A. Yes. But not to wash glasses or to bring glasses.
- 13 are 12 tables in that station. And that station, when the
- 14 people would arrive and they were not ordering anymore or
- 15 eating anymore or drinking and we would need the table,
- Mrs. Scotto would tell us for us to clean the table. 16
- 17 why the waiter would clean the table, so that I could get it
- 18 ready again.
- 19 THE INTERPRETER: To have it ready? To have it ready?
- 20 THE COURT: Seter peyar la mesa?
- 21 THE INTERPRETER: Seter oper. To reset it, I guess,
- 22 yes, reset like in English. Derivation, to reset, set up, to
- 23 reset, set up, yes, maybe.
- 24 THE COURT: Seto peyar.
- 25 THE INTERPRETER: Seto peyar.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

24

25

THE COURT: Set up the table.

- 2 So the waiters clear the table and you reset the table; is that right? 3
 - Correct, but that is not usual, normal, that the waiter would clean the table.
 - Q. Did another busser sometimes help you clean the tables when you were assigned to work as a bar-back?
 - Well, there were two stations in the front part that, many a time, they would see that I was way too busy, and they would help me to -- and they would help me for a little bit.
 - So sometimes the bussers would help each other when one of them was assigned to the bar-back assignment. Correct?
- 13 The busboys, we would always work as a team. Α.
- 14 Q. You mentioned Mr. Anthony Scotto. Mr. Scotto is the owner 15 and manager of Fresco Restaurant, correct?
- 16 Α. Correct.
- 17 And you testified that when you came to Fresco to apply for 18 a job, you spoke with Mr. Scotto, correct?
- 19 Α. Correct.
- 20 Mr. Scotto hired you; isn't that right?
- 21 He told me for me to come back the next day. Α.
- 22 Do you know if Mr. Scotto made the decision to hire you?
- 23 THE INTERPRETER: Your Honor --
 - THE COURT: How could he possibly know what is in the mind of another person? Not a proper question.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

25

MS. KABIR: Withdrawn.

THE INTERPRETER: Also, your Honor, also, if the interpreter very respectfully may be heard: I have to hear counsel on top of my voice too, so sometimes it is becoming very difficult because I am, as I'm doing complete simultaneous, and I don't have one -- and I'm going to try to get one of those, go to the interpreter's office and request an apparatus, sometimes, not that she's not speaking properly, but it is difficult for me to hear her voice even on top of my voice and try to keep the special procedure for a matter that I'm not as familiar as counsel are that have been doing this for over a year, and they know the facts. So I'm not -- I'm being very humble and, very respectfully, sometimes I cannot hear counsel's voice on top of my voice, because I have to --THE COURT: Would it be easier for you to be seated asking the questions?

MS. KABIR: It might be easier.

THE INTERPRETER: Thank you. I have to hear two voices plus my own.

Thank you, your Honor.

BY MS. KABIR:

- Q. Mr. Urgiles, you testified that when you came to look for a job, you met with Mr. Scotto, correct?
- 24 Α. Correct.
 - And he told you to come back to train?

- Urgiles cross
- 1 He told me for me to come back the next day, correct.
- And when you came back to train the next day, you trained 2 Q.
- 3 with another busser, correct?
- When I arrived there, they made me talk to the manager, 4
- 5 Brenner or Brent. He introduced me to another busboy, with
- whom I was going to train. 6
- 7 Q. So is it your testimony that Brent introduced you to the
- 8 busboy for the training?
- 9 A. Correct.
- 10 It wasn't James, the host, who introduced you to the other
- 11 busser?
- 12 James introduced me to manager Brent.
- 13 And you trained for three shifts; isn't that right? 0.
- 14 Correct. Α.
- 15 Q. And do you recall if these were lunch shifts?
- 16 Α. No.
- 17 You trained during dinner? Ο.
- 18 Α. Yes.
- 19 All days? Q.
- 20 No. No, the days varied. One day he would make us train
- 21 during lunch. Another day he would make us train during
- 22 dinner. And another day he would make us train as a stocker.
- 23 Q. And when you were training, was Mr. Scotto observing you
- train in the restaurant? 24
- 25 I suppose so, because he was -- he would -- he would walk

Case 1:13-cv-02992-AT Document 80 Filed 12/22/14 Page 66 of 111

EC9ASAL2ps Urgiles - cross by there or come by there when I was training. Because he's usually in the restaurant most days, correct? Q. A. Almost always, yes. Q. He's almost always there. A. Yes. THE COURT: All right. Let us take our half-of-an-hour break at this time. We will reconvene at 12:25. (Recess) (Continued on next page)

4

5

7

8

Urgiles - cross

1 AFTERNOON SESSION

12:25 p.m.

3 CHRISTIAN URGILES, Resumed.

THE COURT: Remember, sir, that you are still under oath.

6 THE WITNESS: Yes.

THE COURT: You may continue the inquiry.

CROSS EXAMINATION (cont'd)

9 BY MS. KABIR:

- 10 Q. Mr. Urgiles, if you could turn to page 10 of your
- 11 declaration and look at paragraph 51, you testified that "I
- 12 | observed Brent Drill interview and hire some bussers." Isn't
- 13 | that right?
- 14 A. Yes, correct.
- 15 | Q. And when you say you observed these interviews, do you
- 16 | recall how many times you observed Mr. Drill interviewing any
- 17 | bussers?
- 18 A. Yes. Two times.
- 19 Q. On both of these times, do you recall if it was during a
- 20 | lunch shift or during a dinner shift?
- 21 A. That was in between shifts. Excuse me. That was after we
- 22 | finished lunch.
- 23 \parallel Q. So after the lunch shift, that would be approximately
- 24 between 2:30 and before 4 p.m.?
- 25 A. Correct.

EC9ASAL2ps

- Urgiles cross
- And during this time, did Mr. Drill speak with these 1
- potential bussers in the front of the restaurant? 2
- 3 Yes. Α.
- 4 Where were you in the restaurant when these interviews Q.
- 5 happened?
- I was working as a bar-back. 6
- 7 So you were in the front of the restaurant.
- 8 Α. Correct.
- 9 So isn't it true that during the afternoons between lunch 0.
- 10 and dinner, Mr. Scotto leaves the restaurant for a short time?
- 11 Α. Correct.
- 12 Do you recall if Mr. Scotto was in the building when you
- 13 observed these interactions occur?
- 14 I do not remember. Α.
- 15 Q. Do you remember if Mr. Drill asked these individuals for a
- 16 résumé?
- 17 Α. Yes.
- 18 And do you know what he did with those résumés?
- 19 Α. No.
- 20 And do you know if Mr. Scotto interviewed those individuals
- 21 at a later time?
- 22 Α. No.
- 23 And do you know if Mr. Scotto observed these bussers train?
- 24 I would suppose so, I believe so, I think so, because he is
- 25 there at the restaurant.

- And do you know if Mr. Scotto checked these individuals' 1
- references by calling their last employer on their résumé? 2
- 3 Honestly I cannot tell you because I do not know.
- 4 Do you know if Mr. Drill actually hired these individuals? Q.
- 5 I would suppose that he hired them because I saw them
- 6 during training.
- 7 Q. But you don't know what Mr. Scotto had to do with the
- decision to actually hire them as employees in the restaurant, 8
- 9 do you?
- 10 Honestly, I do not know.
- 11 So is it still your testimony that you observed Mr. Drill
- 12 actually hire these individuals?
- 13 Yes, ma'am. Α.
- 14 That's based on your belief, correct?
- 15 Α. I do not -- I do not understand what you mean by "belief."
- You believe that Mr. Drill made the decision, but you also 16
- 17 testified that you don't know if Mr. Scotto made the decision;
- 18 isn't that right?
- 19 A. Correct.
- 20 So other than your belief that Mr. Drill hired them, do you
- 21 have any other basis for testifying, in paragraph 51 of your
- 22 declaration, that you observed Mr. Drill hire these
- individuals? 23
- 24 Well, one of those that he hired was a cousin of mine, male
- 25 cousin. He himself told him for him to come back the next day

for training. So I do not know whether it was he who took --1 made the decision. 2

- And other than these --Ο.
- Α. -- or --

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

19

20

23

24

THE COURT: I have a question. When you use the word "hire," what do you mean? When you use the word "hire," what do you mean?

THE WITNESS: That it was he who told them that he -that they -- that he could work, for him to come for training. When one is called for training, it almost practically means that one is going to work. If one does not have, well, no problems or if the owner did not like the way that he or she worked and he does work well or he is training well, so then they give him the job.

- Q. And in the approximately seven years you worked at Fresco, these were the only two incidents where you observed Mr. Drill interview any potential busboy candidates; is that right?
- 18 A. Correct.
 - Q. Mr. Drill was a floor captain at the restaurant; isn't that right?
- 21 A. Honestly, truly, really, I, I, when I met him, I met him as 22 a manager.
 - Q. I'm not asking if you met him as a manager or as a floor I'm asking you if he worked as a floor captain at

25 Fresco.

- 1 THE INTERPRETER: Floor cap --
- 2 MS. KABIR: A floor captain.
- 3 That is why I answered, I do not know whether he was a 4 floor captain or he was a manager.
 - Q. Do you know if other waiters also worked as a floor captain at Fresco, like Marco?
- 7 Α. Yes.

5

- And Peter? 8 Q.
- 9 Α. Yes.
- And Chuck? 10 Ο.
- 11 I cannot remember about Mr. Chuck.
- 12 So when somebody filled the floor captain role during,
- 13 let's say, a dinner shift, that person was in charge of
- 14 overseeing the service in the entire main dining room
- 15 downstairs; isn't that correct?
- The captain was only in charge of asking about wines, and I 16
- 17 cannot remember that he did anything else.
- 18 Q. So when you say the captain was in charge of the wine, do
- you mean that the captain would go to the table and review the 19
- 20 wine list with the customer --
- 21 Α. Correct.
- 22 -- and advise them on what bottle they should serve?
- 23 Α. Correct.
- 24 And they would go to the basement and bring the bottle
- 25 upstairs to serve the table, correct?

Α. Correct.

1

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

- And Mr. Drill was one of the individuals that you saw do 2 Q. 3 this during dinner shift, correct?
 - I would see him. I would also see him doing it. But, but, but he was introduced to me as a manager, not as a captain.

MS. KABIR: Move to strike as nonresponsive.

THE COURT: I will strike everything from "but."

- Q. And you saw Marco and Peter when they were floor captains; they would do the same thing, correct? They would review the wine list.
- 11 Α. Correct.
- 12 And they would open and serve the wine at the table.
- 13 Α. Correct.
- 14 And you saw Mr. Vosilla do this as well, correct?
- 15 Α. Yes, I've seen him.
- And especially during dinner shifts, when there are good 16
- 17 wine sales, that means more money in the tip pool, correct?
- 18 A. Correct.
- 19 Is this because customers usually tip at least 20 percent
- 20 of the entire bill?
- 21 Α. Correct.
- 22 So the more wine they buy or the more expensive wine they
- 23 buy, the better it is for everybody in the tip pool.
- 24 Α. Correct.
- 25 If you could turn to page 8 of your declaration, paragraph

- no. 45, you testified, "One time in December 2012, Brent Drill 1
- told me to come in and work the next day so that I would work 2
- 3 and receive tips, but not to punch in." Is that correct?
- 4 Α. Correct.
- 5 You go on to state in that paragraph, "I received tips but
- 6 was not paid by Fresco for my work that day. This was for a
- 7 dinner shift on a Friday." Is it your testimony that Brent
- 8 Drill told you, on a Thursday, to come in and work on a Friday,
- 9 but not to punch in?
- 10 He called me to tell me that, I will make you come to work
- 11 the next day.
- 12 And is it your testimony that you did work on a Friday in
- 13 December 2012 without punching in?
- 14 A. Excuse me. I, I withdraw from what I said before. It was
- 15 not on a Thursday that he called me. I was working Friday
- morning, and he told me whether I could work that day, that 16
- 17 same day, but for me to come back, but for me not to punch the
- clock. 18
- 19 Q. And is it your testimony that you did in fact work a dinner
- 20 shift on a Friday and receive tips?
- 21 Α. Correct.
- 22 If we were to review records of the amount of tips you were
- 23 paid and you did not receive tips during a certain shift, you
- 24 would agree that you didn't actually work or receive tips for
- 25 that shift; is that correct?

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

A. Correct.

THE COURT: Are you asking if the records are accurate?

MS. KABIR: I quess I want to know if his testimony is that he actually received tips from the trip pool on a night that he did not punch in.

THE WITNESS: I accepted tips. But I was not paid hours because I accepted to work for tips. When one has requirements, necessities, one does it. I have family. And that is why I did it.

THE INTERPRETER: "when one has needs" would have been a better word, your Honor.

- So is it your testimony you that worked for a lunch shift on a Friday and you clocked in and out, but you stayed for a dinner shift and received tips but did not clock in and out?
- Q. And other than this one time in December 2012, was there another time that you also worked for just tips?
- A. No, ma'am. As I said previously, when we worked there before, we did not have, we didn't have a clock for us to punch and for us to punch when we left. When they would need us, require us, all they did was, they would tell us whether we could work or whether we would want to work, and that is why we came to work.
- Q. So is it your testimony that this was a single isolated incident?

- Α. For me, yes.
- Do you know if it happened to anybody else? 2 Q.
- 3 I do not know, ma'am. Α.
- 4 And did you typically work Friday dinner shifts at Fresco? Q.
- 5 Α. Yes.

- 6 You also testified, on page 11 of your declaration, in
- 7 paragraph 68, that you were suspended by Brent Drill for coming
- late one day because a train was not running. Do you recall 8
- 9 when this happened?
- 10 I do not recall exactly, but, yes, it did happen to me
- 11 I arrived late, and I explained to him that the train --
- 12 I do not know what happened in the train. What happened is
- 13 that the doors remained open and when I arrived to work I
- 14 arrived there a little bit late and I told him. And he said,
- I'm not going to need you today, so then you can go back home. 15
- Do you recall if this was a lunch shift or a dinner shift? 16
- 17 This was during lunch, during one lunch.
- 18 So when you testified that you were suspended by Mr. Drill,
- 19 you mean that he told you that you were not needed for that one
- 20 lunch shift, correct?
- 21 Yes, correct. Α.
- 22 And you're sure that it was Mr. Drill who advised you of
- 23 this and not James, the host?
- 24 Α. It was Mr. Brent.
- 25 So in paragraph 68, when you testified, "I did not see

- Brent Drill speak with Anthony Scotto first before suspending 1
- me," you were referring to this incident where Mr. Drill just 2
- 3 told you that he didn't need you for that shift. Correct?
- 4 Correct. Α.
- 5 So Mr. Drill didn't actually suspend you, did he?
- It was he who suspended me because, if Anthony would have 6 Α.
- 7 been there, Anthony would have told me.
- Anthony would have told you that he didn't need you for 8
- 9 that shift?
- 10 If he would have been up front, in the front portion.
- 11 But at that time, moment, it was Brent who was up at -- in the
- 12 front.
- 13 Were you ever issued a write-up for being late that day? 0.
- 14 Α. No.
- 15 Q. And do you recall how late you were for the lunch shift
- 16 that day?
- 17 I cannot remember at this moment, but it must have been
- 18 about 30, 30 minutes or 30 -- 40 minutes approximately.
- Q. Do you recall if they had another busser working for that 19
- 20 shift in your place, by the time you got there?
- 21 A. No, I cannot recall exactly, but at that time, well, then
- 22 already we already had, we already had in the schedules the
- 23 home call. So then in the home call we had -- when one other
- 24 person was on call, we had to wait until 10 -- until 10:30 or
- 11 o'clock a.m. in order to call and to see whether they would 25

- 1 So then I suppose that -- I suppose that they may have used someone that was on call. I do not know. 2
- 3 Q. So when you're saying that the bussers had to call the 4 restaurant to see if they were needed, that was to speak to the
- 5 host James, correct?
- 6 A. Yes. But James always -- we always had to talk to Brent
- 7 or, or any other manager that was there. So always the manager
- that was there during the morning. And that was Brent who was 8
- 9 there during the morning.
- 10 In paragraph 68 of your declaration, you testified, "On
- 11 another day, one of my co-workers, Abel Reyes, was similarly
- suspended by Drill for arriving late, and I did not see Drill 12
- 13 speak with Anthony Scotto before suspending him." Is that
- 14 correct?
- 15 Α. Correct.
- And when you say that he was -- he had arrived late, do you 16
- 17 recall how late he was for his shift?
- I had already more or less finished, finished bringing the 18
- glasses, bringing them over to the bar, so it must have been 19
- 20 somewhat between 30 minutes or 40 minutes. And he sent him
- 21 back home. Because I was there when he sent him.
- 22 Q. So in your testimony in paragraph 68, when you said that
- 23 you saw your co-worker, Abel Reyes, get suspended, you were
- 24 also referring to him being told he wasn't needed anymore
- 25 because there was another busser performing his duties that

- shift, correct? 1
- During that shift he was just sent home. 2
- 3 And you testified previously you were already done doing 4 your busser work by the time he showed up at the restaurant,

5 correct?

6

7

8

15

- MR. ANDROPHY: Objection, mischaracterizes the testimony.
- THE COURT: Sustained.
- 9 MS. KABIR: I will rephrase.
- 10 You testified previously that Mr. Reyes was 30 or 40 11 minutes late for his shift.
- 12 Α. Yes.
- 13 Is it your testimony that his services were no longer 0. 14 needed because the restaurant had enough bussers by the time he

came to the restaurant for that shift?

- He suspended him only for that shift. 16
- 17 Do you recall if another busser had called in to the restaurant and told to come in because Mr. Reyes was late? 18
- I, I repeat to you once again, ma'am, I do not know, but 19
- 20 during those times, there was already an on-call busser. So I
- 21 do not know whether they called, they called the on-call so
- 22 that he would come to work.
- 23 So is it your testimony that Mr. Reyes was just sent home
- 24 for that one shift?
- 25 Α. Correct.

- Urgiles cross
- 1 And is it your testimony that you don't recall the specific
- 2 reason why he was sent home but it was only for that one shift,
- 3 correct?
- Correct. Yes, ma'am. 4 Α.
- 5 And that's similar to when Mr. Drill had told you, when you
- had come in late, that they didn't need you for that shift. 6
- 7 Α. Yes, ma'am.
- And is that what you mean by the term "suspended"? 8
- 9 Correct. Α.
- 10 Mr. Urgiles, if you could turn to page 12 of your
- 11 declaration, paragraph 80, you testified, "but similarly, the
- employee schedule at Fresco, if there was an issue I or other 12
- 13 employees had with the schedule, like if I could not work a
- 14 particular day, I would speak with Vosilla." Is that correct?
- 15 Α. Correct.
- And by "Vosilla," you're referring to Attilio Vosilla; is 16
- 17 that right?
- 18 Correct, ma'am. Α.
- 19 And you testified previously that for some time period you
- 20 had a request to not work on Wednesdays or Thursdays. Correct?
- 21 Α. Correct.
- 22 And is it your testimony that you communicated this request
- 23 to Mr. Vosilla?
- 24 Α. Correct.
- 25 And did you see Mr. Vosilla create the schedule every week

at Fresco?

1

- Well, he was the one who, who would make the schedules. 2 Α.
- 3 And did you see him make the schedules?
- I had seen him in the office. 4 Α.
- 5 Did you ever see Mr. Vosilla discuss the schedule with
- Anthony Scotto? 6
- 7 I cannot recall, ma'am.
 - Q. Do you know if Mr. Vosilla was making the schedule --
- 9 strike that.
- What days are the schedules posted every week at the 10
- 11 restaurant?
- 12 On Fridays or Saturdays.
- 13 Q. And you testified previously that you sometimes worked on
- 14 Fridays, correct?
- 15 A. Correct.
- But that you had a standing request not to work on 16
- 17 Wednesdays or Thursdays. Correct?
- 18 A. Correct.
- So you never saw Mr. Vosilla meet with Anthony Scotto to 19
- 20 discuss the schedule on Thursdays, did you?
- 21 Could you repeat the question for me, please, again,
- 22 because I did not understand you.
- Q. If you didn't work in the restaurant on Thursdays -- strike 23
- 24 that.
- 25 Did you ever see Mr. Vosilla meet with Mr. Scotto to

- discuss the weekly schedule every week?
- A. Honestly I never saw him. But when one, when one would
- fill in or request something, one would tell Attilio, but
- Attilio would tell us that he had to ask Anthony. But I never
- saw him have a meeting with him.
- Q. And when you worked in the restaurant on Fridays, the
- schedule had already posted, correct?
 - Correct. Α.
 - And that's posted near the coat-check stand where James is?
 - It was placed there and we had, we had another schedule at
- (Continued on next page)

the stocker's area.

- BY MS. KABIR:
- So, in paragraph 80 of your declaration when you say that 2
- 3 Vosilla was in charge of the employees' scheduling, that's not
- 4 accurate, is it?
- 5 Could you please repeat the question for me?
- 6 Q. You testified previously that when you would communicate
- 7 your scheduling requests to Mr. Vosilla he said that any of
- your requests had to be approved by Mr. Scotto; isn't that 8
- 9 right?
- 10 Correct. I suppose so because -- I suppose because one
- would tell Attilio and Attilio would tell us that he had to 11
- 12 talk to Anthony. But, I do not know whether he met with him or
- 13 he would make the decision, I do not know, sir.
- 14 Q. So, would it be more accurate to say that Mr. Scotto was in
- 15 charge of employee scheduling at Fresco?
- No. Because why? Because the one who would give us the 16
- schedules was Mr. Attilio. 17
- Q. Mr. Urgiles, when you worked on Fridays you testified 18
- previously that you already saw the schedule posted for the 19
- 20 following week by the time you started your shift, correct?
- 21 Correct, but Fridays the schedules were posted when
- 22 Mr. Attilio arrived to the restaurant, at the restaurant.
- 23 So, you didn't see Mr. Scotto actually print the final
- 24 schedule on Friday mornings, did you?
- 25 MR. ANDROPHY: Objection. Is counsel testifying as to

EC95sal3

1

2

4

8

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

25

who printed the schedule?

THE COURT: Well, it is a question. Overruled.

3 THE WITNESS: No.

- BY MS. KABIR:
- 5 Q. You didn't actually see Mr. Scotto post the schedule 6 either, right? Because it was there by the time you started 7 your shift?
 - A. No.
- 9 Q. So, isn't it true that you don't know who was in charge of 10 employee scheduling at Fresco?
- 11 Well, with whom I had to speak to for my schedule, it was 12 with Mr. Attilio.
 - Q. So, would it be more accurate to state that Mr. Vosilla was in charge of collecting employees' scheduling requests from the bussers at Fresco?
 - A. Well, we had to tell Mr. Attilio whether we wanted to, whether we would have one day off or an afternoon off or what have you. But, he would tell us that we would have to wait until he would speak to Papa because he would call him -- he would call Mr. Anthony Scotto, he would call him papa.
 - In paragraph 82, page 12 of your declaration, you testified that you saw, you observed Mr. Vosilla fire an employee on at least one occasion, correct?
- 24 Α. I saw him only once.
 - And you saw it firsthand?

EC95sal3 Urgiles - cross

- 1 A. Yes, correct.
- 2 | Q. And you testified that you saw him fire a busser named
- 3 | Patricio, correct?
- 4 A. Correct.
- 5 Q. Mr. Vosilla is the manager you were describing on the
- 6 dinner shifts, correct? Correct?
- 7 A. Correct.
- 8 Q. So, is it your testimony that you saw him fire this busser
- 9 | named Patricio during dinner?
- 10 A. Correct.
- 11 Q. You also testified that Patricio was assigned to the
- 12 | stocker position and was required, by the Chef Raul, to do the
- dishes and that they had an argument, correct?
- 14 A. Correct.
- 15 | Q. And did you witness this argument firsthand?
- 16 A. Correct.
- 17 | Q. Mr. Urgiles, isn't it true that the sous chef at Fresco,
- 18 Raul Ramirez, worked during the lunch shifts?
- 19 | A. He works until 5:00 p.m.
- 20 | Q. And 5:00 p.m. is when the dinner shift starts, correct?
- 21 A. Correct.
- 22 | Q. You previously testified that this occurred during the
- 23 | dinner shift?
- 24 A. Yes, correct, but I'm going to explain something to you.
- 25 Mr. Raul Ramirez, the sous chef, there were days when he had to

Urgiles - cross

- work dinner because, for whatever reason, the chef -- I think 1 that they would have certain interchangeability between the 2
- 3 chef and the sous chef that he would work on Saturdays and he
- would work Friday evenings. So then that day he worked Friday 4
- 5 evening.
- Q. You also testified that Anthony Scotto was not in the 6
- 7 restaurant at the time, correct?
- 8 Α. Correct.
- 9 Do you know if he may have been in another part of the
- 10 building?
- 11 I do not know so.
- 12 You just didn't see him there, correct?
- 13 I did not see him there. Α.
- 14 And do you know if Mr. Vosilla made the decision to fire
- 15 Patricio?
- I saw him when he dismissed him. 16
- 17 So you don't know if he was in contact with Mr. Scotto?
- 18 Honestly, no. I do not know because it was something that
- 19 happened so quickly. He did not want to wash some plates and
- 20 he said that he would not work as a dishwasher, so then the
- 21 sous chef told him if you do not want to work, he called the
- 22 general manager and that was Attilio and he told him and he
- 23 said, okay, so then I'm not going to need you.
- 24 Q. When you testified that he said I'm not going to need you,
- 25 who are you describing?

- Α. Mr. Patricio.
- 2 And who told him that I'm not going to need you? Q.
- 3 Mr. Attilio. Α.
- 4 And do you recall approximately how long ago this was? Q.
- 5 Honestly, I cannot recall at this moment.
- 6 Do you recall if Mr. Vosilla was sending Patricio home for
- 7 that shift?
- A. No. No. No, he told him that he was not going to need him 8
- 9 anymore if he was not going to wash dishes and he told him that
- 10 he was not -- and he, in turn, said that he was not a
- 11 dishwasher.
- 12 Do you know if Patricio quit?
- 13 Α. No.
- 14 THE COURT: Where did this happen? What part of the
- 15 restaurant did this happen in?
- THE WITNESS: At the area of the stocker's area. 16
- 17 THE COURT: And did you observe the sous chef call
- Attilio? 18
- 19 THE WITNESS: Yes.
- 20 THE COURT: You heard him call him?
- 21 THE WITNESS: Yes.
- 22 THE COURT: And so how much time lapsed between the
- time that the sous chef told Patricio to wash dishes and the 23
- 24 time that Attilio told him that he was fired?
- 25 THE WITNESS: About 10 minutes.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

They were arguing, Patricio and the sous chef Raul, because when one would come in as a stocker we had to both work as a stocker and to wash dishes because we didn't have a dishwasher for approximately one or two hours. So then, when one would or when he would come in, he told him, oh, aren't you going to wash the dishes? And he said, no, I made my application here as a busboy. And then he said then, okay. You have to wash the dishes or otherwise I will call the manager. And he said if you want to do so, you can call him but I'm not going to wash dishes.

So, then they continued going on with that and so then he called Mr. Attilio and he told him. So then Attilio asked him, Are you going to wash the dishes or are you not going to wash them? And then he said no. So then he said no, so then he said, you know what? I'm not going to need you anymore if you are not going to wash dishes. So then he said, okay, then I'm just leaving. Because we all have to do -- well, when we were working as stockers we had to do that there. Also they made us do that. Those who worked during the morning, the dishwasher would leave at 2:30 and we had to wash the dishes, the glasses and the silverware, and from there we had to go in the kitchen -- excuse me, we had to go into the dishwasher room and wash what was there and to take them out and then for us to wash them once again, in other words, before our time to leave would be our time for us to leave. And then he would come. So

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

18

then to wait until the other stocker would come in to find everything nice and ready we had to clean the walls, we had to clean the bags, we had to clean the rug. Everything that was dirty surrounding the -- there was a station kind of like where they made the special salads, whatever they had there, we had to sweep all of that.

So then we had to throw away the bags where the bottles had been, the empty bottles. We had to take them to the basement. All of that is what we had to do. So, that was a lot of work for us to do, for us to wash the silverware --I'm sorry, for us to perform as dish washers. So then my friend told him no. So then they said, okay, so then I don't need you.

- BY MS. KABIR: 14
- 15 Q. Mr. Urgiles, do you remember what day of the week this 16 occurred?
- 17 I do not remember. Α.
 - And do you remember what year this occurred?
- I do not recall that either at this moment. 19 Α.
- 20 And it is your testimony that you were a first-hand witness
- 21 to the argument between Patricio and the sous chef Mr. Raul
- 22 Ramirez?
- 23 Α. Yes. Correct.
- 24 And that you also testified that Mr. Vosilla told Patricio
- 25 that he wasn't needed anymore, correct?

Α. Correct.

1

- Mr. Urgiles, do you recall if this occurred on a Saturday? 2 Q.
- 3 I do not recall, ma'am. Α.
- 4 Do you recall whether or not this occurred on Saturday, May Q.
- 5 16th, 2009?
 - I cannot recall, ma'am.
- 7 And if this incident occurred on May 16th, 2009, is it your testimony that you worked that shift during dinner on Saturday? 8
- 9 THE COURT: So he just testified that he didn't know
- 10 what date it occurred on.
- 11 Q. Mr. Urgiles, on page 3 of your declaration, paragraph 17,
- 12 you testified that on some days you were required to wash
- 13 dishes and in the last sentence it says, "this would often
- 14 happen during times when Fresco was less busy, mostly in the
- 15 summer months."
- 16 Correct?
- 17 Α. Correct.
- 18 So, isn't it your testimony that you were asked to wash
- dishes when you were assigned to work in the stocker position 19
- 20 only on rare occasions when the restaurant was slow?
- 21 A. Every week the shifts would change so each person had their
- 22 day as a stocker. When it was my turn to be a stocker it was
- 23 my turn to wash dishes because I was told that I had to wash
- 24 dishes. When I worked as the coffee maker, also when it was a
- 25 slow time, they made me work as a coffee maker and as a

7

- stocker, both jobs in one.
- I am asking specifically about your testimony about when 2
- 3 you were asked to wash dishes. In paragraph 17 of your
- 4 declaration it says you were only asked to wash dishes when you
- 5 were assigned to be a stocker and only when the restaurant was
- 6 less busy, mostly in the summer.
 - Is that accurate?
 - MR. ANDROPHY: Objection. Mischaracterizes the
- 9 declaration testimony.
- 10 THE COURT: Sustained.
- 11 BY MS. KABIR:
- 12 Q. Mr. Urgiles, how often were you assigned to work as a
- 13 stocker?
- 14 It would depend on the weeks, it would depend on the days.
- We would have one shift, two shifts. It would depend. 15
- 16 It would be rotated amongst the bussers, correct?
- 17 Not amongst all of the bussers.
- 18 It would be rotated amongst bussers at Fresco, correct?
- 19 Not amongst all of the bussers. Α.
- 20 We had a fellow worker, I do not know whether he works
- 21 there, his name is Chris, he is European. We never saw him
- 22 work not as a stocker, neither as a helper, nor coffee maker,
- 23 barback or up front at the bar. We never saw that. We always
- 24 saw him work on the floor and during private parties.
- 25 I am going to ask you about when you worked as a stocker.

EC95sal3

Urgiles - cross

- 1 How often were you asked to wash dishes?
- 2 A. The times that I was working there, if it happened, during
- 3 | the summertime -- if it was during the summertime.
- 4 Q. So, during the summertime you were assigned as a stocker,
- 5 some summers you would never be asked to wash dishes. Is that
- 6 your testimony?
- 7 A. Yes, correct.
- 8 Q. So, can you estimate whether or not you were asked to wash
- 9 dishes more than three times when you were assigned to work as
- 10 | a stocker?
- 11 A. Those times that I would work as a stocker it could have
- 12 | been two times, one time when I was a stocker. It would depend
- 13 where we would be placed within the floor because we were here,
- 14 | for example, here in the schedules that you provide to us,
- 15 | there it said stocker. Before it didn't say stocker, it said
- 16 | Section 9. Before it would say Section 9.
- 17 | Q. On page 4 of your declaration, paragraph 21, you testified
- 18 | about a busser named Chris?
- 19 A. Yes. Correct.
- 20 | Q. And that you never saw Chris working as a stocker or a
- 21 coffee preparer or a coffee helper, correct?
- 22 A. And neither as a barback but, yes, it is correct.
- 23 Q. And the coffee preparer gets more than the busser in the
- 24 | tip pool, correct?
- 25 A. That is correct. But there was more work to be done at the

- coffee station. 1
- So the coffee station was a more desirable assignment 2
- 3 because you could earn more tips in that assignment, correct?
- A. Well, if we are talking about tips, yes, but if we were 4
- 5 walking about workload, many of the people wouldn't want to
- work there. 6
- 7 Q. You also testified that Chris was assigned two parties,
- 8 correct?
- 9 A. Yes, ma'am.
- 10 And by parties are you referring to the private events
- 11 hosted in the room upstairs called the Tuscan Room?
- 12 Α. Correct.
- 13 Q. And for parties that are hosted in the Tuscan Room
- 14 sometimes there would be multiple bussers assigned to that
- 15 room, correct?
- 16 Correct. Α.
- 17 Were you ever assigned to work in that room?
- 18 Yes, ma'am. Α.
- And for the bussers that were assigned to work in that 19
- 20 room, they have to provide the same service to the tables in
- 21 the private party room as the bussers on the floor downstairs,
- 22 correct?
- 23 Α. Correct.
- 24 So, when you are working upstairs in the party room you
- 25 still have to go back and forth between the kitchen to carry

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

bread and appetizers and also restock the clean silverware and dishes in time to reset the tables upstairs, correct?

- Correct. Α.
- So, being assigned to the Tuscan room upstairs can be very Q. demanding during a shift because you are always going back and forth through the restaurant carrying these items up and down the stairs, correct?
- A. Correct, but I want to explain something to you.

Yes, what you are saying, it is true, that we had to run up and down the stairs, but it was never a party of 20 or 30 persons, just one person working in these parties when 20 or 30 persons were there. There were 16 or 12 persons of 120 are going to come and 10 would arrive and it was for only one busboy. And it wasn't a very heavy load because for a busboy because I also worked there but when I -- when there was a party with a lot of 30 or 40 persons, two busboys, we would work there in the upstairs carrying plates, glasses, carrying glasses, silverware, bread, bean dip.

- So you would agree that the bussers would help each other when they were assigned to the party room, correct?
- Α. Correct.
- Q. And for the food that is served in the private party room, the runners from the restaurant bring it from the kitchen upstairs, correct?
- 25 Correct. Α.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

- And if there is a party of 30 or 40 people, the runners need help carrying those trays up the stairs, correct?
- Correct. Α.
- So the bussers who are assigned to the stocker or the Ο. coffee stations or the barback stations or the dining room floor help the bussers carry that food upstairs to the private party room, correct?
 - A. No. No, I do not remember that I would have -- that we would take those things up. We always had the runners who were the ones that were taking the food up. When we would take the food upstairs it was because the chef would tell us go upstairs and take that and leave everything that you have else to do.
- So, is it your testimony that the chefs made bussers help the runners carry the food upstairs to the private party room for large parties?
- Well, that would depend how busy the restaurant was. generally, he wanted for us to take the plates over or the dishes over to the tables or to the party. It was the chef who would tell us to leave everything else that you might have and you take that there. Of course, he wouldn't say to us, please or something like that. He would just say "take it" because you have to take it.
- So when you were assigned as a busser in the private party room upstairs, your responsibility was to set and reset the tables in the private party room, correct?

- Α. Correct.
- And if the party wanted to order coffee or tea, you would 2
- 3 take the orders for the room and go downstairs to the coffee
- 4 station and prepare those drinks, correct?
- 5 Yes. Correct. Α.
- And then you would bring those drinks upstairs back from 6
- 7 the kitchen to the private party room?
 - Α. Correct.
- 9 But you didn't actually run the appetizers or entrees from
- 10 the kitchen upstairs to the private party room, correct?
- 11 Well, what happens is that the runners would take the food
- 12 upstairs to the Tuscan Room. We had a big table there and
- 13 there the manager who would work with us would tell us, here,
- 14 take this. Take this to a certain table. And then sometimes
- 15 one was very busy even when one was busy.
- Q. Did you carry those trays upstairs with the food when you 16
- 17 were assigned as a busser to that private party room?
- 18 A. Sometimes when they needed a salad that hadn't been taken
- 19 upstairs or a dish that had remained there, then they would
- 20 send me.
- 21 Q. So sometimes, if they needed help carrying that food
- 22 upstairs, correct?
- 23 Α. Correct.
- 24 And you had to help serve the food once it was brought
- 25 upstairs, correct?

EC95sal3

- Correct. Α.
- And you testified that a manager instructed you where to 2
- 3 serve the food when you were serving as a party busser,
- 4 correct?

- 5 A. Correct, because we had a manager -- a party manager and he
- 6 would go -- he would only go -- once the food was already ready
- 7 was when he would go up there. And then, for example, where
- there was a salad or there was pasta, he would go upstairs and 8
- 9 he would give it to us and then we would place it on the table.
- 10 The pasta would be served there in the back part because we had
- a small kitchen there and we would take it out from there to 11
- 12 place it on the tables with the help of the waiters.
- 13 Q. And by party manager, are you referring to the party
- 14 captain?
- 15 Α. Yes.
- Did the party captain also take food and drink orders from 16
- 17 the private party?
- 18 Honestly, I never saw that. I only saw the waiter take
- orders for drinks and food. 19
- 20 Did you see the party captains pour wine for the quests?
- 21 Sometimes. Α.
- 22 Did you see the party captains submit all the food orders
- 23 to the kitchen for the entire party room?
- 24 I did not understand your question. Α.
- 25 Strike that. Q.

EC95sal3

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

Did you see the party captain coordinate the orders taken by the waiters and submit the ticket for the party to the kitchen?

- Α. Yes.
- And did you see the party captains interact with the guests throughout the meal?
- I didn't -- the ones who were there was always us, the busboy, and the waiter. When the persons would arrive and the party captain would arrive, we would be there when he was bringing the wine bottles so then that we would know what bottles we were going to serve.
 - Did you see the party captain present the bill to the host of the party at the end of the night?
- 14 Α. Yes.
- And did you see Marco working as a party captain? 15 Q.
- 16 Α. Downstairs? Yes.
- 17 Did you see Peter working as a party captain? Ο.
- 18 Α. Downstairs? Yes.
- 19 Did you see Brent Drill working as a party captain? Q.
- 20 Yes, I saw him. Α.
- 21 And did you see Attilio Vosilla working as a party captain? Q.
- 22 Yes, I saw him. But, the one who performed most as a party
- 23 captain was Mr. Attilio.
- 24 And are you referring to parties during dinner shifts?
- 25 Α. Correct.

- Mr. Urgiles, you testified earlier that the runners at 1
- 2 Fresco get a slightly larger share of the tip pool, correct?
- 3 Correct. Α.
- And when you worked at Fresco, the runners at the 4 Q.
- restaurant had been working at Fresco for a long time, correct? 5
- Correct. 6 Α.
- 7 And the runners at Fresco, at some point, used to work as
- 8 busboys, isn't that right?
- 9 Α. Correct.
- 10 And there is fewer runners than bussers at Fresco, correct?
- 11 There are fewer positions?
- 12 A. Well, honestly I do not know, but there are very few
- 13 runners, but they did use busboys also as runners.
- 14 MS. KABIR: May I have a minute, your Honor?
- (Counsel conferring) 15
- 16 MS. KABIR: We have no more questions.
- 17 THE COURT: Mr. Urgiles, you started at Fresco in
- 18 January 2006, correct?
- 19 THE WITNESS: Yes, ma'am.
- 20 THE COURT: There came a time when you took a second
- 21 job at another restaurant and so you were working at both
- 22 restaurants at the same time, correct?
- 23 THE WITNESS: Correct.
- 24 THE COURT: When did you take the second job?
- 25 THE WITNESS: I do not recall exactly, whether it was

Urgiles - cross

- 1 | 2008 or 2009 or 2010. I do not remember very well.
- 2 THE COURT: Redirect?
- 3 MR. ANDROPHY: Yes, your Honor.
- 4 | REDIRECT EXAMINATION
- 5 BY MR. ANDROPHY:
- 6 Q. Mr. Urgiles, do you still have in front of you Defendant's
- 7 | Exhibit A?
- 8 | A. Yes.
- 9 Q. Can you turn to page, Defendant's Exhibit A-57?
- 10 | A. Yes.
- 11 | Q. Do you see on the schedule, can you tell us whether you
- were scheduled to work Saturday that week?
- 13 A. Correct. Yes.
- 14 | Q. How about on page 58? Were you scheduled to work dinner on
- 15 | the week -- that is page 58 -- on Saturday?
- 16 | A. Yes.
- 17 | Q. And on page 59?
- 18 | A. Yes.
- 19 Q. When your job was -- when you worked as the coffee
- 20 preparer, did you take food to tables on every shift that you
- 21 | worked as a coffee preparer?
- 22 | A. Perhaps about 5 percent, 10 percent.
- 23 | Q. So that is 5 or 10 percent of the shifts that you worked as
- 24 | a coffee preparer that you did that at all?
- 25 A. Yes.

- 1 If you were working as a coffee preparer, did anyone help you prepare the coffee and tea and iced tea and similar drinks? 2
- 3 Α. No.

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

- 4 When you worked as a barback you testified that part of the Q. 5 time you had busboy duties in the bar area; is that correct?
- 6 Correct. Α.
 - And part of the shift you would be assisting and preparing things in the bar itself, correct?
- 9 Correct. Α.
 - Do you know approximately what percentage of your time on those shifts you spent doing busboy duties at the tables in the bar area?
 - I did not understand the question. Α. Excuse me.
 - When you worked when you were assigned to work as a barback, what percentage of your shift would you be performing regular busboy duties for the tables in the bar area?
 - As a busboy, about 20 to 25 percent, more or less. Α.
 - And what were you doing the rest of your time on the shift?
 - It was my turn for me to work at the bar, at the counter, because we had different glasses that we had to wash. were pinot glasses, cabernet glasses, champagne glasses, martini glasses, water glasses. All of those we had to wash by
- 23 hand and we had to dry them and to place them back and replace
- 24 it -- the decanters -- and we had to bring glasses from the
- 25 back part, from the stock room back to the bar area because the

Urgiles - redirect

- 1 glasses that were used for sodas were very different from those 2 than the ones that we usually had to wash.
 - Q. Thank you.

3

4

5

Was Anthony Scotto the only owner at Fresco by Scotto, to your knowledge?

- A. I do not know whether he was the only owner, but 6
- 7 Mrs. Scotto was always there and the sisters would go there and
- Mr. Scotto would also go. So, I do not know whether he was the 8
- 9 only owner.
- 10 Q. Do you know if Mr. Scotto was the only manager at Fresco by
- 11 Scotto?
- 12 I was introduced to Mr. Attilio also as a general manager
- 13 and Mr. Brent as a manager. Morning -- morning ones. I also
- 14 knew about that.
- Q. When you were training at Fresco by Scotto, did Mr. Scotto 15
- 16 follow you around your entire shift to observe your training?
- 17 A. Are you asking me whether Mr. Scotto was looking, observing
- 18 me?
- 19 Was he spending his entire time of your shift Q. Yes.
- 20 observing you?
- 21 Yes. He would come by there.
- 22 Was he also doing other things at the restaurant?
- 23 He -- many a time he was at the VIP section. Many a time
- 24 he would take care of the VIP customers.
- 25 You were asked about other people who worked as captains, a

Peter and Marco; do you recall that?

Α. Yes.

1

2

5

6

7

3 Were Peter and Marco introduced to you as managers? 0.

4 MS. KABIR: Objection. Leading question.

> THE COURT: Sustained.

- BY MR. ANDROPHY:
- Q. You testified that the schedule was usually posted on
- 8 Friday, correct?
- 9 A. Correct.
- 10 Do you recall at what point during the day on Friday the
- 11 schedule would be posted?
- A. Always when Mr. Attilio would arrive and, if not, during 12
- 13 the evening. So then, during the evenings, he would take it
- 14 out and he would place it -- he would place one at the kosher
- 15 room.
- Q. Coat check, I believe. 16
- 17 THE COURT: Coat check.
- In the coat check room and the other in the section of the 18 19 stockers.
- 20 INTERPRETER: My apologies.
- 21 Q. Do you recall approximately how many times during the total
- 22 time you worked at Fresco that you were asked to wash dishes?
- 23 A. Always during the summer. Always when I was working as a
- 24 It could have been twice a week, once. It would
- 25 depend according to how the stocker was -- whether the manager

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

18

19

20

21

25

would designate or assign me to which section for me to go. 1

MR. ANDROPHY: Thank you. I have no further questions.

> THE COURT: Recross?

MS. KABIR: Can we have five minutes?

THE COURT: Five minutes?

MS. KABIR: Two minutes.

MR. BENSON: Three minutes.

(Counsel conferring)

RECROSS EXAMINATION

BY MS. KABIR:

Q. Mr. Urgiles, you testified previously that you spent two hours a day when you were assigned as a barback, two hours a

shift, busing the tables in the bar section, correct?

15 MR. ANDROPHY: I believe that mischaracterizes

16 testimony. I don't have the transcript in front of me but I

17 don't recall.

> THE COURT: I don't recall what his testimony was so you may ask him whether he spent two hours.

BY MS. KABIR:

- Q. Did you spend two hours, at least, clearing and resetting
- 22 the tables and the place settings at the bar and performing
- 23 other busser duties when you were assigned to the barback
- 24 position?
 - I repeat once more, I would spend two hours only -- no,

- excuse me, only 45 minutes to one hour I would spend doing my 1
- 2 side work at the bar. After that it was my turn, when the
- 3 clients would arrive, it was my turn to wash glasses, to bring
- 4 ice, to bring water, to bring iced tea, to bring many things.
- 5 So, I would spend more than two hours as a barback. That is
- 6 why when you asked me whether I was helping the waiters, I told
- 7 you, yes, but not much. You asked me whether the busboys would
- 8 I told you, yes, a little bit, because I had two
- 9 busboys in Sections 1 and 2.
- 10 So, I believe you testified earlier, Mr. Urgiles, that the
- 11 waiters would clear the tables but that you would reset them,
- 12 correct?
- 13 Yes, ma'am. But, when I had the time to do so. Α.
- 14 Q. And you also testified that when you were spending 20
- 15 percent of your shift as a barback you were washing glasses and
- decanters and other types of glasses that are kept at the bar, 16
- 17 correct?
- 18 A. Correct, but I did not come out with a percentage of when I
- 19 was bringing water upstairs and bringing everything else
- 20 upstairs.
- 21 Isn't it true that at Fresco the bartenders also washed the
- 22 glasses at the bar?
- 23 That I remember that they helped me? Never. Α.
- 24 Ο. But you would agree that they washed glasses too, correct?
- 25 I never said that. Α.

2

5

6

7

8

9

- Is it your testimony that the bartenders at Fresco never washed glasses?
- 3 A. During the time that I worked there? To me, they never 4 helped me.
 - Q. So, when you testified previously that you were washing decanters and wine glasses, that was pertaining to the dinner shifts when you worked as a barback, correct?
 - Α. Lunch or dinner.
 - Q. I am asking if you were referring to a dinner shift in the prior testimony.
- 11 MR. ANDROPHY: The witness answered the question.
- 12 THE COURT: I heard an answer: "Lunch or dinner."
- 13 So, is it your testimony that you also had to wash and
- 14 replace decanters and wine glasses during the lunch shift?
- A. Yes, ma'am. 15
- Isn't it true that there are not very much wine orders 16 17 during the lunch shift?
- 18 A. That is true, but there are many persons, VIPs, that who would be served the house wine in the glasses -- in the 19 20 glasses -- let's call them the more elegant glasses for them
- 21 and we had to wash them.
- 22 Q. And I believe you previously testified that between noon
- 23 and around 2:00 p.m. the tables during the lunch shift in the
- 24 bar area are full, correct?
- 25 Α. Correct.

- 1 And that the walk-in guests are seated in that area of the 2 restaurant, correct?
 - Correct. Α.

- 4 And for that period of time when you were assigned as a Q. 5 barback, is it your testimony that you didn't provide busser
- 6 services to those tables?
- 7 I had two jobs there, ma'am. 70 percent or 80 percent of that was as a barback and 20 or 25 percent was as a busboy.
- 9 Why? And I'm going to explain to you why. Because the 10 waiters -- it is true that they would assist and take and clean
- 11 the tables and remove dishes from the tables, but they never
- 12 wanted to take them over to the backbar. They would always
- 13 just leave them there at the counter of the bar.
- 14 Q. So, is it your testimony that from between noon and 2:00
- 15 p.m., when you were assigned as a barback, there was more
- demand from customers to have clean wine glasses during lunch 16
- 17 than having their tables cleared and reset in that area of the
- 18 restaurant?
- 19 I did not understand your question. Could you repeat it
- 20 again, please?
- 21 Q. For those two hours between noon and 2:00 p.m., isn't it
- 22 true that you spent most of those two hours providing your
- 23 busser duties to the tables at the bar? Isn't that right?
- 24 Α. At the bar? Yes.
- 25 And isn't it also true that between 12:00 and 2:00 there

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

are not very much wine or other alcoholic beverage orders in the restaurant, correct?

- A. Yes. There is always orders for things to drink. There were always people who had wanted to drink alcoholic beverages. If I didn't have to clean glasses I had to wash, I had to bring glasses, I had to bring plates, I had to bring silverware for the bar because we needed it because we needed ice, because we needed beer if we needed it. So, it is not only to be in the back part just washing glasses, there are many things that we have to do behind the bar counter.
- Q. I asked you specifically between 12:00 and 2:00 during the lunch rush, isn't it true that you were providing assistance to the waiters in that area of the restaurant by busing the tables and resetting the tables?

MR. ANDROPHY: Objection. Asked and answered.

THE COURT: Sustained.

MS. KABIR: We have nothing further.

MR. ANDROPHY: If I can have just one minute?

THE COURT: No. I am not going to have re-redirect.

There are too many witnesses for that. But, you are going to call your next witness.

Mr. Urgiles, you may step down.

THE WITNESS: Thank you, your Honor.

(witness steps down)

MR. ANDROPHY: If I may have one minute to make sure

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

13

14

the next witness I am going to call will also be available

2 | tomorrow so there won't be disruption?

(Pause)

MR. ANDROPHY: We call Pablo Alvarado.

PABLO ALVARADO,

called as a witness by the Plaintiffs,

having been duly sworn, testified through the interpreter,

Urgiles - recross

as follows:

THE DEPUTY CLERK: Please state your name for the record.

THE WITNESS: Excuse me, I'm a little bit sick. My

12 | name is Pablo Alvarado.

THE COURT: Do you feel well enough to testify?

THE WITNESS: Yes.

- 15 DIRECT EXAMINATION
- 16 BY MR. ANDROPHY:
- 17 | Q. Mr. Alvarado, do you recognize the document I just handed
- 18 | up to you?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 | Q. And is that the declaration that you signed as your direct
- 21 | testimony for this case?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 | Q. And if you can turn to the last page, is that your
- 24 | signature?
- 25 A. Yes, sir.

MR. ANDROPHY: We ask that this be admitted as 1 Plaintiff's Exhibit 106. 2 3 MR. BENSON: No objection, your Honor. THE COURT: It is admitted. 4 (Plaintiff's Exhibit 106 received in evidence) 5 MR. ANDROPHY: And we also ask that Plaintiff's 6 7 Exhibits 27, 29, and 30, and also Plaintiff's Exhibit 86 be admitted. 8 9 THE COURT: Those are referred to in the declaration? 10 MR. ANDROPHY: Yes. 11 THE COURT: Any objection? 12 MR. BENSON: Just checking to make sure that we know 13 what we are agreeing to. 14 MR. ANDROPHY: And if I can also add to that 15 Plaintiff's Exhibit 92? MR. BENSON: No objection, your Honor. 16 17 THE COURT: All of those items are admitted. (Plaintiff's Exhibits 27, 29, 30, 86 and 92 received 18 in evidence) 19 20 THE COURT: Sir, you may step down. You must return 21 tomorrow to testify at 9:00 a.m. sharp. 22 THE WITNESS: Yes. Yes, ma'am. Thank you. 23 THE COURT: We are going to alter the trial schedule 24 because it is going too slow. We will start at 9:00, we will

break between 1:00 and 2:00, and we will go until 5:00. If the

Case 1:13-cv-02992-AT Document 80 Filed 12/22/14 Page 110 of 111

EC95sal3 Alvarado - direct pace does not pick up I will add more hours to each day. See you tomorrow at 9:00. (Adjourned to 9:00 a.m., December 10, 2014.)

1	INDEX OF EXAMINATION
2	Examination of: Page
3	ENRIQUE SALINAS
4	Cross By Mr. Benson
5	Redirect By Mr. Androphy
6	CHRISTIAN URGILES
7	Direct By Mr. Androphy
8	Cross By Ms. Kabir
9	Cross By Ms. Kabir
10	Redirect By Mr. Androphy 188
11	Recross By Ms. Kabir 192
12	PABLO ALVARADO
13	Direct By Mr. Androphy 197
14	PLAINTIFF EXHIBITS
	PLAINTIFF EXHIBITS Exhibit No. Received
15	
15 16	Exhibit No. Received
15 16 17	<u>Exhibit No.</u> 105
15 16 17	Exhibit No. 105
15 16 17 18	Exhibit No. Received 105
15 16 17 18 19	Exhibit No. Received 105
15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Exhibit No. Received 105
15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Exhibit No. Received 105
15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Exhibit No. Received 105
14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25	Exhibit No. Received 105